



**INTERNATIONAL TROPICAL
TIMBER COUNCIL**

**COMMITTEE ON
REFORESTATION AND FOREST
MANAGEMENT**

Distr.
GENERAL

CRF(XXXIII)/5
11 September 2003

Original: ENGLISH

THIRTY-THIRD SESSION
3 – 8 November 2003
Yokohama, Japan

**Synthesis Report on Ex-Post Evaluations of
Projects in the field of Demonstration Areas/Model Forest for
Sustainable Forest Management implemented in Asia**

PD 105/90 Rev.1 (F)

Model Forest Management Area – Phase I

PD 14/95 Rev.2 (F)

**Model Forest Management Area – Phase II
(Malaysia)**

PD 14/92 Rev.2 (F)

**A Demonstration Program of Sustainable Utilization of
Tropical Forests by Means of Differentiated Management in
Hainan Island, China – Phases I, II, III
(China)**

PD 16/95 Rev.2 (F)

**Forest Health Monitoring to Monitor the Sustainability of
Indonesian Tropical Rain Forests
(Indonesia)**

PD 12/97 Rev.1 (F)

**Forest, Science and Sustainability: The Bulungan Model Forest
(Indonesia)**

Prepared for ITTO by

Dr. Erik Lammerts van Bueren

Dr. Eberhard F. Bruenig

Dr. Mauro Silva Reis

Ex-Post Evaluation

Projects in the field of Demonstration Areas/Model Forest for Sustainable Forest Management implemented in Asia

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1.	INTRODUCTION	1
2.	EVALUATION SCOPE, FOCUS AND APPROACH	2
3.	THE PROJECTS, FACTS AND SUMMARY OF KEY FINDINGS	3
	3.1 Model Forest Management Area – Phase 1 (Malaysia) PD105/90 rev.1 and Phase II (Malaysia) PD 14/95 rev.2	4
	3.2 Forest Health Monitoring to Monitor the Sustainability of Indonesian Tropical Rain Forest, Indonesia (PD 14/95 rev.2)	8
	3.3 Forest Science and Sustainability: The Bulungan Model Forest Kalimantan, Indonesia (PD 12/97 rev.1)	11
	3.4 A Demonstration Program of Sustainable Utilization of Tropical Forests by Means of Differentiated Management in Hainan Island, China – Phase I, II and III, China (PD 14/92 rev.2)	14
4.	FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	18
	4.1 Appropriateness of the Design	18
	4.2 Participation, Stakeholder Involvement	21
	4.3 Efficiency	21
	4.4 Effectiveness, Achievements, and Impacts	23
	4.5 Sustainability of Interventions	24
	4.6 Effectiveness as Demonstration Area	24
	4.7 Contribution to the ITTO Objective 2000	26
5.	CONCLUDING REMARKS.....	27
6.	SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	29
	ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	33

Annex I Terms of Reference

Summary

Projects in the field of Demonstration Areas/Model Forest for Sustainable Forest Management implemented in Asia

1. INTRODUCTION

Ex-post evaluation of projects is one of the tools for the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO) to further improve its effectiveness and efficiency. Thematic ex-post evaluations are undertaken to accomplish an integrated assessment on the effectiveness, relevance and impact of projects with a common goal. Five projects in Asia, which had in common demonstration features, were subject of this evaluation. This particular feature is an important aspect of the evaluation. Two projects in Malaysia were in fact Phase I and Phase II of one overall project and have been assessed and reported on in an integrated way.

2. EVALUATION SCOPE, FOCUS and APPROACH

The primary purpose of the ex-post evaluation is to provide a concise diagnosis of the four projects related to Demonstration Areas/Model Forests for Sustainable Forest Management including the current management status of the forests within the projects area of influence. The contribution of the projects towards the achievement of ITTO's Objective 2000 is also evaluated.

The evaluation was carried out in June/July 2003. A team of three experts, studied relevant documents, visited the project sites and Head Quarters of the Executing Agencies and discussed with stakeholders various aspects of the projects in a 32 day trip.

The assessment focussed on project design, efficiency, effectiveness including the demonstration area/forest model approach to promote sustainable forest management and the impact of the project on the forest sector, including Executing Agencies, forest industry and local populations, and the project's area of influence.

The recommendations produced by the evaluation team are separately directed at Executing Agencies and ITTO.

The synthesis report summarizes the findings from the individual project evaluations and presents the overall conclusions and recommendations.

3. The PROJECTS

The following projects were subject of this Ex-post Evaluation:

1. PD 105/90 Rev.1 (F) PD 14/95 Rev.2 (F)	Model Forest Management Area – Phase I Model Forest Management Area – Phase II (Malaysia)
2. PD 14/92 Rev.2 (F)	A Demonstration Program of Sustainable Utilization of Tropical Forests by Means of Differentiated Management in Hainan Island, China – Phases I, II, III (China)
3. PD 16/95 Rev.2 (F)	Forest Health Monitoring to Monitor the Sustainability of Indonesian Tropical Rain Forests (Indonesia)

4. PD 12/97 Rev.1 (F)	Forest, Science and Sustainability: The Bulungan Model Forest (Indonesia)
-----------------------	---

The four projects have in common that they are formulated to help achieve sustainable forest management but their focus and approach are rather divers. The **Model Forest Management Area (MFMA)** project in **Sarawak, Malaysia**, is designed to establish sustainable management in a delineated area (162,000 ha) of predominantly logged forest in which a number of concessionaires are operating. The **Forest Health Monitoring (FHM)** project in **Indonesia** is a research monitoring and training project. The tangible assets here are established monitoring plots on Java, Sumatra and Kalimantan. The **Bulungan Model Forest** project in **Kalimantan, Indonesia**, gives the impression of activities within a delineated area, the Bulungan Research Forest (321,000 ha), but project activities are in fact wide spread and executed outside the area. Finally the **Demonstration Program of Sustainable Utilization of Tropical Forests on Hainan Island, China**, is an integrated land use approach, focussing on conservation and wise use of tropical forests, applied at various areas and sites.

The aggregated financial contribution by ITTO to these four projects amounted to US\$ 8,591,891.

Table 1 Duration and financing of the projects

Project		ITTO	Other ¹⁾	Project duration
		USD 1000		
MFMA Sarawak/Malaysia	PD	1,760,176	259,168	2 years, 6 months
105/90		1,998,325	1,386,000	3 years
	PD			
14/95				
FHM, Indonesia	PD	457,000	574,516	5 years
16/95				
Bulungan, Indonesia	PD	1,096,390	506,500	4 years, 3 months
12/97				
SFM Hainan, China	PD	3,280,000	P.M	8 years, 6months
14/92				

¹⁾ Unverified figures from project proposal documents. Figures refer mainly to anticipated contributions, cash and in kind, from governments and Executing Agencies. Reality may differ substantially from these estimates.

4. FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This chapter highlights lessons and draws conclusions from the findings as they are presented in the separate evaluation reports of the four projects and in chapter 3 of this synthesis report. A major criterion for the identification of issues to observe and to conclude on is the relevance to ITTO in its capacity of project funder and manager.

Specific emphasis is laid upon commonalities between the projects to support general conclusions. Although the four projects have in common that they are formulated to help achieve sustainable forest management, their focus and approach are rather divers. In fact only the Model Forest Management Area project in Sarawak, Malaysia has been initiated to bring about sustainable forest management at timber concession unit level.

The differences between the projects limit to a certain extent the possibilities to draw general conclusions.

4.1 Appropriateness of design

Proper design of the project is a key to smooth implementation and success in terms of achieving project objectives and anticipated impact. Three particular aspects are distinguished; the strategic value, the consistence (logical framework) and the development process of the project proposal. Strategic value of the project design has been defined by the evaluation team as “the potential of the project to contribute effectively to its development objective, and the relevance and feasibility of that development objective”. Strategic value is determined by matters such as; clarity and relevance of the specific objectives, complexity of the project, representativeness, accessibility and socio-economic situation of project location, and choice of project partners.

CONCLUSIONS Project design

- 1) Matters which determine the **strategic value** of a project are **not always explicitly addressed** or given serious attention. This has proven to hamper efficient implementation and to weaken the ability of projects to effectively contribute to their respective development objective.
- 2) **Relevant and feasible development objectives and precise formulation of specific objectives** and consequently using the same terminology are important prerequisites for an unambiguous well understood project.
- 3) Use of a **logical framework** facilitates project design and contributes to coherence and transparency but is **no guarantee for the consistency** between activities, the anticipated outputs and objectives.
- 4) A feeling of ownership right at the formulation of the project facilitates and strengthens commitment and co-operation during the implementation. Supply driven projects (and/or **science oriented projects**) tend to **overlook the importance of seriously involving stakeholders** with the formulation of the project.
- 5) The project **development process** is often not transparent and not **documented**.
- 6) **Project implementation and effectiveness benefits from a combination of implementing agencies and organisations**, which cover responsibility for national/regional policy formulation and implementation, research and science, and on the ground implementation.
- 7) Careful **site selection** is crucial for efficient and effective project implementation.
- 8) **Integration and spatial linking** of conservation and income generating measures and activities are a key to successful conservation projects.

- 9) Projects with a duration longer than 3 to 4 years benefit from a **phased approach** (division in two or more phases, which are separately submitted for approval and funding). Phased approach provides insight in the follow-up of each phase. It also allows for necessary adjustments in the proposal and budget for the follow-up phase.

RECOMMENDATIONS Project design

- 1) Executing Agencies: Avoid areas for project implementation with exceptional complex natural, logistic and administrative conditions, do not add unnecessary complicity regarding number of actors and responsible local governments through delineation of the project area.
- 2) Executing agencies: Apply a logical framework to assure consistency of the project design and accord of anticipated objectives with outputs
- 3) Executing Agencies: Full commitment and proactive participation from those actors who should play indispensable roles during later stages of the project or even after project completion must be vested during the formulation phase and maintained during the implementation phase.
- 4) Executing Agencies: Costs estimates of facilities and activities and the time required to achieve planned outputs should be as realistic as possible.
- 5) ITTO, Executing Agencies: The project development process should be documented in particular with respect to involvement of stakeholders and the degree to which ownership is perceived.
- 6) Executing Agencies: Project design and implementation should secure integration and spatial linkage of measures and activities of one project.

4.2 Participation, stakeholder involvement

While stakeholder consultations during the project preparation had been in all cases insufficient, efforts were made to increase involvement and participation during the implementation of the projects. This could not prevent that crucial support and cooperation of some stakeholders did not build up.

CONCLUSION Participation, stakeholder involvement

- 10) Involvement and evident input in the development phase of the project creates a sense of shared ownership, which provide a firm basis for proactive cooperation during and beyond the implementation phase.

4.3 Efficiency

Efficiency is the amount of input (such as, quality and time of human resources, equipment and funds,) relative to the achieved outputs. **Efficiency** of project execution is for a great deal **conditioned by project design**. (see 4.1)

Frequent personnel turnover has in some cases impeded project process or the effective transfer of knowledge.

Budget estimates fall in most cases short compared to reality. Causes are underestimation of required time to execute activities and inaccurate and incomplete listing of all relevant budget items including travel costs, facilities and equipment. But also external factors as currency fluctuations and financial crises have influenced the availability of funds

CONCLUSIONS Efficiency

- 11) The projects have produced a great deal of the envisaged outputs but only after **extension of the implementation period and with additional funds.**
- 12) **Efficiency** of project execution is to a great extent **conditioned by project design** including accurate estimation of budgets.
- 13) **Full commitment and support at all levels of the executing agency** and strong linkages between the executing agencies and the involved actors in the district and in the field proved to be an important condition for assuring smooth and efficient project implementation.
- 14) Local office and **permanent presence** at the project site are a prerequisite for efficient implementation.
- 15) Opportunities for cooperation with other ITTO projects and (international) programmes have hardly been used.
- 16) **Steering committees**, provided they are small and determined to execute their task, are indispensable project governance tools.
- 17) Adequate (scientific) knowledge of **consultants** is no guarantee for ample practical “hands-on” experiences and ability to advise in practical concrete situations.

RECOMMENDATIONS Efficiency

- 7) ITTO, Executing Agencies: promote more intensive communication and cooperation with other similar ITTO projects and relevant (international) programmes in the area.
- 8) Executing Agencies: Secure permanent presence of project management at the project site.
- 9) ITTO, Executing Agencies: Steering committees must not be seen as an information forum. Other instruments should be used to keep stakeholders informed and involved.

4.4 Effectiveness, Achievements and Impact

Effectiveness of a project may be expressed by its contribution to the development objective, while the relevance to ITTO of the development objective itself may also be taken into account. Therefore, effectiveness should be measured by assessing the relevance of the development objective, the relevance of the project's specific objectives to the development objective and the consistence of outputs with the specific objective. This is in the first place a **matter of project design** (see 4.1), and in the second place a matter of efficient implementation (see 4.3).

CONCLUSIONS Effectiveness, achievements and impact

- 18) The projects have produced a great deal of their anticipated outputs and specific objectives.
- 19) The effectiveness and potential impact of a project is to a great extent determined in the **design phase** of the project.
- 20) Awareness of urgency and feasibility to change forest policy and management has become stronger as a result of the ITTO projects
- 21) Executing agencies and local communities have clearly benefited from the projects. For other stakeholders such as timber associations and concession holders benefits were less univocal.
- 22) Training components are indispensable for transfer of knowledge and skills and for securing sustainability after project completion
- 23) Projects have achieved unanticipated positive side effects.
- 24) Projects have insufficiently elaborated extension and dissemination mechanisms

RECOMMENDATION Effectiveness, achievements and impact

- 10) ITTO and Executing Agencies: A dissemination and extension strategy should be an integral part of each project proposal. The strategy should elaborate on ways and means of dissemination and transfer of information and skills to defined target groups.

4.5 Sustainability of Interventions

In all cases the same observation was made, agencies were eager to go on with similar activities but continuation was considered to be entirely depending on further financial support by ITTO or other donors. This makes sustainability very uncertain. Sustainability of the interventions are further threatened, depending on the type of project, by encroachment, illegal logging, vandalism, and fire.

CONCLUSIONS Sustainability of interventions

- 25) Recipient countries and Executing Agencies consider follow-up actions of completed projects too easily a matter of external funding.
- 26) Sustainability of interventions is jeopardized by this attitude and by lack of law enforcement and autonomous developments, such as encroachment and fires.

RECOMMENDATION Sustainability of interventions

- 11) ITTO: to include in project proposals a post project implementation and extension phase which will be financed by the government and co-financed by ITTO.

4.6 Effectiveness as demonstration area

The **concept of demonstration areas** stems from the early 1990s before forest certification came to life. The idea was to further step up the quality of forest management in a particular forest management unit (concession area) and to demonstrate the feasibility of high level forest management in practice. Three prerequisites should be fulfilled to achieve these objectives. First, the forest manager should be committed to **further improve forest management**. Second, the forest manager would allow interested parties to **visit his forest and to share information**. Third, an **information and extension** plan should be developed and implemented.

CONCLUSIONS Effectiveness as demonstration area

- 27) The aim of a demonstration area for timber production is to further step up the quality of forest management and to demonstrate the feasibility of high level forest management in practice, this requires an operational information and communication plan.
- 28) None of the project areas has reached the stage of a demonstration area. Those which have the potential based on present performance have no information and communication programme in place.
- 29) The Zedtee concession area within the present MFMA in Sarawak, has the potential to be developed successfully as a demonstration area.
The Malinau watershed, East Kalimantan could serve as a representative example of a forest development area, but not necessarily to demonstrate SFM.
The linkage and interactions between the management of the Jianfengling National Park , Hainan Island China,(conservation, education, tourism) and the adjacent areas (changed sources of income) could well be demonstrated.
Forest Health Monitoring is feasible and the two demonstration plots, West Java Indonesia are well chosen and established.

RECOMMENDATION Effectiveness as demonstration area

- 12) ITTO: ITTO should explore the willingness with the government of Sarawak/Malaysia and the concessionaire to develop the Zedtee concession as a demonstration area.

4.7 Contribution to the ITTO Objective 2000

ITTO objective 2000 refers to exports of wood and wood products from sustainable managed sources. So anything that contributes to the sustainable management of timber resources contributes potentially to objective 2000. It is clear that some activities contribute indirectly while other activities have a direct effect. The TOR of the mission explicitly asks to identify the contribution of projects as regards the implementation of the priority actions identified by ITTO as essential for progress towards the objective 2000.

CONCLUSION Contribution to the ITTO objective 2000

- 30) Almost any activity pertaining directly or indirectly to sustainable management could be conceived as a contribution to ITTO objective 2000. It therefore loses its significance as a distinguishing factor for relevance of projects, unless criteria are developed, which indicate direct contributions to the achievement of objective 2000.
- 31) Most projects undertook activities and produced results which indirectly may be perceived to contribute to achieving ITTO objective 2000. Only one project contributed directly by implementing more sustainable harvesting methods at a practical scale.

RECOMMENDATION Contribution to the ITTO objective 2000

- 13) ITTO: ITTO may wish to further develop criteria to determine what projects are perceived to contribute directly to achieving ITTO Objective 2000

5. CONCLUDING REMARKS

What is the added value of ex-post evaluations?

The question is what may be expected from an ex-post evaluation in addition to the wealth of information already made available through critical analysis and reviews and documented in completion reports and (interim) review reports.

Unlike the ones who write completion reports, the evaluation team is not engaged in the project and is able to give an impartial judgment. This ability should be **used in particular**, though not exclusively, to **assess the origin of the project, the project formulation process, the relevance of the project objectives, cooperation and participation, and the impact of the project**. Being ex-post, the evaluation has the opportunity to assess the situation in the project area after project completion, which adds to the insight of the real impact of the project.

RECOMMENDATION Added value of ex-post evaluations

- 14) ITTO: The secretariat may consider to organize financial assessments, including justification of budget items, which are more in depth than regular audit reports. This could be realized separately or by adding an expert to a broader evaluation team.
- 15) ITTO: Ex-post evaluation should focus on carefully selected issues, taking into account the already available information from project completion reports and “mid-term” reviews. Issues of particular interest are: the origin of the project, the project formulation process, the relevance of the project objectives, cooperation and participation, and the impact of the project.

How to make lessons learned?

Completion reports, evaluation reports contain “lessons learned”. Many of those are familiar and seem to be reiterated over and over again. Apparently lessons are not learned, at least not sufficiently. Turning lessons into action requires an **action plan to compile, analyze, translate lessons into implications for project design, implementation and monitoring and transfer to those who develop, implement and monitor projects**.

RECOMMENDATION Lessons learned

- 16) ITTO: The ITTO secretariat may launch an activity to compile, analyze, translate lessons and experiences from projects into implications for project design, implementation and monitoring and make this information available to those who develop, implement and monitor projects.

Timing interim reviews, ex-post evaluation and approval follow-up projects.

The ex-post evaluation team came across a couple of so called “mid term” reviews (MFMA and Bulungan), which had been executed shortly before the completion of the project. This makes it even more necessary that a following ex-post evaluation would not look at the full array of issues but at **carefully selected issues to avoid duplication of work.**

In both cases, MFMA and Bulungan, project proposals had been submitted and approved by ITTO prior to the ex-post evaluation. The proposals may not comply with the findings and recommendations of the ex-post evaluation. If there is any opportunity to learn from lessons then it would be with the development and implementation of a follow-up project.

RECOMMENDATIONS Timing of mid-term and ex-post evaluations

- 17) ITTO: Mid-term evaluations should be carried out timely so that project management may be able to correct actions according to the findings and recommendation from these evaluations.
- 18) ITTO: In cases where an ex-post evaluation is anticipated, ITTO should not accept a follow-up project proposal prior to the execution of the evaluation and should promote the incorporation of appropriate conclusions and recommendations.

Reporting and evaluation formats.

The format for reporting as contained in the ITTO Manual for Project Monitoring and Evaluation, second edition, 1999, appeared to lead, and indeed had led in former evaluation as well as project completion reports, to annoying repetitions. Finally and after consultation with the ITTO secretariat, the team decided to follow a more straight forward format. This very report is the result of that approach.

RECOMMENDATION Reporting and evaluation formats

- 19) ITTO: Revise the reporting formats to avoid repetition and enhance accessibility.

Projects in the field of Demonstration Areas/Model Forest for Sustainable Forest Management implemented in Asia

1. INTRODUCTION

Ex-post evaluation of projects is one of the tools for the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO) to further improve its effectiveness and efficiency. Thematic ex-post evaluations are undertaken to accomplish an integrated assessment on the effectiveness, relevance and impact of projects with a common goal. In 2002 six projects were evaluated in the field of sustainable forest management implemented in Latin America. Five projects pertaining to the same theme implemented in Asia are the subject of evaluation in this report. Thus adding valuable information to the insight already gained from the evaluation in Latin America. The projects in Asia all claim that they have been developed with the aim to provide a demonstration area or model forest for sustainable forest management. This particular feature is an important aspect of the evaluation.

Among the five projects, the two Malaysian projects were in fact Phase I and Phase II of one overall project. These two projects have been assessed and reported upon in an integrated way. As a result four reports on separate projects and one synthesis report have been produced. The following projects were subject of this Ex-post Evaluation:

1. PD 105/90 Rev.1 (F) PD 14/95 Rev.2 (F)	Model Forest Management Area – Phase I Model Forest Management Area – Phase II (Malaysia)
2. PD 14/92 Rev.2 (F)	A Demonstration Program of Sustainable Utilization of Tropical Forests by Means of Differentiated Management in Hainan Island, China – Phases I, II, III (China)
3. PD 16/95 Rev.2 (F)	Forest Health Monitoring to Monitor the Sustainability of Indonesian Tropical Rain Forests (Indonesia)
4. PD 12/97 Rev.1 (F)	Forest, Science and Sustainability: The Bulungan Model Forest (Indonesia)

2. EVALUATION SCOPE, FOCUS and APPROACH

The primary purpose of the ex-post evaluation is to provide a concise diagnosis of the four projects related to Demonstration Areas/Model Forests for Sustainable Forest Management including the current management status of the forests within the projects area of influence so as to point out the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures. The contribution of the projects towards the achievement of ITTO's Objective 2000 is also evaluated. Further objective of the evaluation is to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future as well as to make recommendations on the need for similar projects. Finally the effectiveness of the demonstration area/model forest approach to promoting sustainable management is assessed and commented on.

The evaluation was carried out in June/July 2003 at the request of the ITTO Secretariat following the decision taken by the Committee on Reforestation and Forest Management in November 2003. A team of three experts, Eberhard Brünig (Germany), Erik Lammerts van Bueren, teamleader, (the Netherlands), and Mauro Silva Reis (Brazil) studied relevant documents (as sent by ITTO prior to the mission and as produced by the projects), visited the project sites and Head Quarters of the Executing Agencies and discussed with stakeholders various aspects of the projects in a 32 day trip. (see Itinerary ANNEX I)

The evaluation team followed in general terms the guidelines as contained in the ITTO Manual for Project Monitoring, Review and Evaluation and the specific terms of reference (see ANNEX II). The assessment would focus on project design, efficiency, effectiveness including the demonstration area/forest model approach to promote sustainable forest management and the impact of the project on the forest sector, including Executing Agencies, forest industry and local populations, and the project's area of influence. The terms of reference spell out the issues for recommendations.

The recommendations produced by the evaluation team are separately directed at Executing Agencies and ITTO.

This synthesis report summarizes the findings from the individual project evaluations and presents the overall conclusions and recommendations.

3. The PROJECTS: FACTS and SUMMARY of KEY FINDINGS

The four projects have in common that they are formulated to help achieve sustainable forest management but their focus and approach are rather diverse. The **Model Forest Management Area (MFMA)** project in **Sarawak, Malaysia**, is designed to establish sustainable management in a delineated area (162,000 ha) of predominantly logged forest in which a number of concessionaires are operating. The **Forest Health Monitoring (FHM)** project in **Indonesia** is a research monitoring and training project. The tangible assets here are established monitoring plots on Java, Sumatra and Kalimantan. The **Bulungan Model Forest** project in **Kalimantan, Indonesia**, gives the impression of activities within a delineated area, the Bulungan Research Forest (321,000 ha), but project activities are in fact wide spread and executed outside the area. Finally the **Demonstration Program of Sustainable Utilization of Tropical Forests on Hainan Island, China**, is an integrated land use approach, focussing on conservation and wise use of tropical forests, applied at various areas and sites.

The aggregated financial contribution by ITTO to these four projects amounted to US\$ 8,591,891.

Table 1 Duration and financing of the projects

Project		ITTO	Other ¹⁾	Project duration
		USD 1000		
MFMA Sarawak/Malaysia 105/90	PD	1,760,176	259,168	2 years, 6 months
	PD	1,998,325	1,386,000	3 years
	14/95			
FHM, Indonesia 16/95	PD	457,000	574,516	5 years
Bulungan, Indonesia 12/97	PD	1,096,390	506,500	4 years, 3 months
SFM Hainan, China 14/92	PD	3,280,000	P.M	8 years, 6 months

¹⁾ Unverified figures from project proposal documents. Figures refer mainly to anticipated contributions, cash and in kind, from governments and Executing Agencies. Reality may differ substantially from these estimates.

3.1 Model Forest Management Area – Phase I and Phase II, Sarawak, Malaysia (PD 105/90 Rev 1, and PD 14/95 Rev.2)

Project description

Background/location

The project is one of the eight projects in response to the findings of the ITTO mission to Malaysia early 1990. The mission recommended to establishing a model logging concession that could serve as an area for training, research and demonstration. During phase I of the project the Model Forest Management Area (MFMA) was selected on a set of criteria, including topography, forest types and rural communities. The size should comply with the average area of a timber licence, which should at least be 100,000 ha. The selected area of the MFMA (162,500 ha; of this, 153,200 ha production forest) straddles the boundaries of two territorial forestry and administrative charges, the Regional Forest Offices and Divisions (Bahagian) Bintulu and Sibul, and two gazetted permanent forests, the Anap and Mukah Protected Forests. It currently includes two main and three small timber licences which, except for the Zedtee area, straddle the boundaries of the MFMA.

The forest is typical Central-Sarawakian Lowland (<500 m alt.) and Hill (500 – 1000 m alt.) Mixed Dipterocarp Forest. Less than half of the area is flat to undulating, less than half is mountainous and one-tenth is very steep mountainous. The soils are typically of poor to at best average quality. The production forest area has been harvested once and been largely heavily logged, with noticeable differences of logging standards between licences.

About 5% of the area has been encroached by shifting slash-and-burn agriculture (SA). The totally protected forest area comprises 55,000 ha including 10 so-called Virgin Jungle Reserves (VJR) with about 3,000 ha, stream bank buffer reserves and local water reserves.

Development objective

The development of policies, strategies and implementation procedures for the sustainable utilisation and conservation of mixed hill forests of Sarawak and their genetic resource and for the maintenance of the ecological balance in the state”.

Specific objectives

Phase I
to select a sizeable area of the Permanent Forest Estate (of typical concession size) area as test and demonstration area and to draft a development plan for the MFMA

Phase II
establish systems of sustainable forest production management for the mixed hill forests of Sarawak within limits of the concession; train staff and workers from both public and private sectors in implementation; provide demonstration of viable new methods and technologies for sustainable production management in the concession

The three **main problems** to be addressed are:
to determine the levels of sustainable log supply
to reduce environmental damage caused by harvesting operations.
to monitor the progress and results of all uses of the forest and to enforce management regulations and harvest control

Project duration: Phase I, June 1993 – December 1995; Phase II, June 1996 – June 1999.

Completion report December 2000. A follow-up project has been approved and funded by ITTO

Midterm evaluation: October 1999

ITTO contribution: US\$1,998,325 conform project proposal

Implementing agency

Forest department Sarawak

Evaluation highlights

Project design

Strategic value

Compliance with the original idea to establish a model logging concession that could serve as an area for training, research and demonstration would have increased the value of the project. Project management, and accountability of licence holders would have benefited if the project area was confined to one or two entire licence areas instead of the actual two license areas, which partly straddle the boundaries of the MFMA and which are operated on by five contract logging companies.

Consistence (logical framework)

The project was designed prior to the condensation of the accumulated experience of ITTO in its Manual for Project Formulation, Second Edition, of 1999. The formulation of the project lacked the benefit of a well-structured logical framework, that would have facilitated proper linkage and integration of activities.

Project development process

Important stakeholders such as the local communities and the concession holders were actively involved in the implementation phase. However involvement and a feeling of ownership right at the formulation of the project would have eased and strengthened commitment, coopeation and proactive participation during the implementation.

Participation of stakeholders

Participation by the major stakeholders was slow to develop. At the time of the evaluation, some of the timber companies still lacked a sense of commitment and responsibility, others and the local agricultural communities participated very willingly and constructively.

Efficiency

The **administrative organisation** of the project was satisfactory and had been effectively and efficiently applied to the end of Phase II. However, a greater and possibly continuous presence and activity of project personnel in the area would be desirable and essential for eventually achieving the objectives.

The progress of the project was guided and monitored by a **Project Steering Committee** (PSC). The MFMA Project Coordinator acted as chairman of the 6-monthly meetings in which representatives of ITTO and the Federal Ministry of Planning, Kuala Lumpur, and project consultants and their Sarawakian counterparts participated.

The **National Forestry Inventory (NFI) management staff** might have had a greater input in organisational aspects in the project. Frequent personnel turnover in the Ministry of Forestry (MOF) did not benefit the project process or the effective transfer of knowledge.

The **complexity** of natural and administrative conditions (see project design), is an obstacle to achieving constructive dialogue and efficiency of cooperation between the project management and the loggers. Assessing the degree of achievement is also very difficult if seven concessions, five operators and a participating native/local society in rapid transition are involved. The practice of building chains of subcontractors is not

conducive for assuming responsibility creating commitment to achieving sustainable forest management.

International consultants, notably on road construction it was said, did not always fulfil expectations, which impeded the realisation of some crucial objectives. At least consultants should have adequate scientific knowledge and ample practical “hands-on” experience.

The **meteorological** monitoring and **hydrological** research and monitoring were poorly coordinated and for technical reasons, data recording and processing met with difficulties. Soil surveying and research failed to reach targets in some areas due to time constraints.

There was no provision for statistical and physical coordination between the various **inventory and plot monitoring systems**. The initially poor, and with time declining, accessibility of plots added to the problems. The mensurational and taxonomic weaknesses of the database cast doubts on the yield predictions and the increment and yield projections.

The costs of some **budget** items had been grossly underestimated in the original proposals and subsequent planning. Digital Aerial Imagery consumed large sums of money but results were apparently disappointing in kind and substance. The images cover only part of the MFMA and are rarely used. Funds for continued efficient operation and maintenance were obviously not adequate.

Effectiveness and impact

According to the approved project document the three main problems to be addressed are:

- to determine the **levels of sustainable log supply**
- to **reduce environmental damage** caused by harvesting operations.
- to **monitor** the progress and **results of all uses** of the forest and to **enforce management regulations** and harvesting guidelines.

Log supply and **harvesting volumes** are still ruled by diameter limits. Harvesting volumes should be based on accurate growth data related to the basal area. Permanent sample plots are the basis. The project could not show enough evidence that a growth and yield monitoring system is in place.

The project has **increased awareness** with the forest department and the private sector on the implications of environmental damage, the concept of sustainable forest management and the urgency to cooperate with each other. Some contractors realise that **changes are** not only necessary but also **beneficiary**. Less clear and noticeable is the commitment and sense of responsibility among company shareholders and staff.

The **reduced impact logging (RIL) experiments**, using ground equipment, confirmed effectively that sustainable procedures of harvesting are technically and economically feasible. Practice demonstrated that **residual stands** after the second cutting cycle are promising for the **third cutting cycle** while there has been no sound and convincing evidence forthcoming which would indicate loss of biodiversity, species or genes.

Insight is obtained in the feasibility of **Helicopter logging** as an alternative for traditional logging operations. Helicopter logging is too expensive to be competitive and is used only to log class IV and upper class III where otherwise no logging would have taken place.

The most noticeable effects of the introduction of sustainable forest management (SFM) procedures in the area were improved **water quality** in downstream areas, **reduction of timber waste** and **damage to soil** and residual forest growing stock, and some **improvements in**

infrastructure design and construction such as banks in skid roads to prevent run off and lowering of maximum road gradients from 18% to 12%, but road openings are still too wide.

The Sarawak Timber Association designed and launched an ambitious **training programme** and it made efforts to institutionalise vocational training. However, difficulties were encountered in recruiting competent consultants and because of the traditional preference of local labour for short-term employment and change.

Skills and safety standards in harvesting operations lag behind expectations, partly as a result of the native preference for short-term employment. This and the failure to establish the planned **permanent forest station** in the MFMA affected the effectiveness of the Project Phase II negatively with respect to implementation and control of SFM.

The **planting** of logging-road sides, especially with *Dryobalanops sp.*, and the afforestation of secondary growth and farmland are successes. A scheme **to plant several species** of multi-purpose timber trees in shifting cultivation areas was generally appreciated, provided the trees were property of those who planted them and not of the government.

Support to local communities with concepts and technology transfer to cope with the continued process of transition from their traditional lifestyle towards a lifestyle induced by and adapted to modern technologies and economies.

Dissemination of project results

The project published 11 comprehensive reports during Phase I and 27 during Phase II. The reports cover the whole range of technical subjects which are relevant to the project.

Not accomplished outputs of project proposal

- Training at all levels. Deficient management and operational expertise (there are yet no formal requirements as to the education of management staff and training of forest workers of concession holders and contractors) and weak enforcement standards and procedures continue to hinder progress.
- A model management plan and guidelines for concessionaires to draft a management plan are missing.
- Effective transfer of relevant information to target groups f.i. Guidelines on Reduced Impact Logging.
- Establishment of the planned permanent forest station in the MFMA.
- Growth and yield monitoring system.
- Development of a demonstration site with an accompanying information system.

Sustainability of interventions

The establishment of the MFMA intervened effectively in on-going processes in the area primarily in the following directions: replacement of customary logging by ground-based RIL, creating awareness of the need for change among all parties involved (stakeholders) and consolidation of the claims of local communities and providing concepts for coping with cultural change.

Whether these interventions will prove sustainable will depend on the consistency, focus and effectiveness of Phase III.

Demonstration value

Part of the MFMA could successfully be developed as a demonstration area. The MFMA is fairly easy to reach (approx. 3 hours from Sibuluhur by car). The MFMA is gazetted as Permanent Forest Estate. The variety in topography and forests offers excellent opportunities to demonstrate site adapted extraction techniques. In the Zedtee area residual stands look promising even after the second cutting cycle. Cooperation with local farming communities are developing well. The no go areas such as terrain class IV and upper III and protected areas could function as an effective network of corridors and refuges. Various shortcomings in management and operations demonstrate visibly the effects of errors and failures. The demonstration function of the Zedtee area needs to be operationalised by general information materials, technical and scientific publications and information sign-posting in the forest. The effectiveness of demonstration function depends, among others, on security of tenure of the concession for at least one felling cycle with trustworthy option of extension.

3.2 Forest Health Monitoring to Monitor the Sustainability of Indonesian Tropical Rain Forest, Indonesia (PD 16/95 Rev 2)

Project description

Background/location

In 1989, the Indonesian Government initiated the National Forestry Inventory (NFI) project. The focus of the NFI is on production. The objective is to sample, estimate and monitor commercial timber volume, volume increment and losses (mortality), and area of the forest growing stock. The NFI system did not include indicators relevant to other aspects of sustainable forest management such as environmental, social and economic attributes.

The Forest Health Monitoring (FHM) was conceived in 1995 as a mainly ecological supplement of NFI to supply data on what were considered to be primary indicators of "forest health". "Forest health" was assumed to be indicated by selected parameters of tree productivity, biodiversity, crown condition, damage and site quality. Some socio-economic parameters developed by the Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR) were experimentally measured. FHM plots were established in West and Central Java, East and South Kalimantan and Sumatra.

Development objective

"To determine the current condition of Indonesian forest ecosystems with respect to sustainability, biodiversity (and socio-economic conditions) and subsequently to track changes and trends" (in order to enable the Government of Indonesia (GOI) to develop appropriate policies for sustainable forest management and utilisation of forest resources").

Specific objectives and outputs

- identification (and definition) of indicators and techniques which are suitable for assessing and monitoring forest (ecosystem) health and its changes by measuring certain parameters; amend these with socio-economic indicators; 2 outputs.
- design and implementation of FHM sampling within the NFI scheme and to report on the establishment of the FHM in natural and plantation forests in technical reports; 2 outputs.
- establishment of special demonstration and training plots in various forest types and conditions for the benefit of Indonesia and the Southeast Asian region; 2 outputs.
- linking remote sensing with ground monitoring in the combined NFI and FHM schemes, and to report on the result and the chances to use information on changes in the A-storey of tropical rainforests and planted forests as an early warning signal; 2 outputs.
- use of FHM data for scrutinising NFI data on productivity and report the results with respect to productivity (increment); 1 output.

Duration: 1 January 1996 – 30 December 1998, extended to 30 December 2000.
Completion report March 31, 2001

Midterm evaluation: none.

ITTO contribution: US\$ 457.000, conform project proposal.

Implementing agencies

South East Asian Regional Centre for Tropical Biology, SAMEO-BIOTROP in cooperation with the Agency for Forest Research and Development, FORDA, the National Forest Inventory bureau of the Indonesian Ministry of Forest, MOF and the United States Development Agency (USDA) Forest Service.

Evaluation highlights

Project design

Strategic value

The mensurational difficulties of measuring, logistic obstacles to reach plot locations and, consequently, the high costs of operating the FHM as a large-scale sampling scheme favour close integration and simultaneous execution of measurements of NFI and FHM. Therefore linkage of the FHM process with the NFI process and network is a strong point of the design.

However the strategic value of the project design is somewhat slackened by a certain ambiguity and inconsistency of the interchanging use of the terms “forest health”, “forest sustainability” and “forest condition”. The objective of the data collection and assessment becomes therefore somewhat diffuse. The terminology to indicate levels of parameters was also lacking consistency with respect to assessment questions, criteria and indicators. These facts cause confusion with respect to the hierarchy of the assessment objects (productivity, biodiversity, vitality, site quality). The unambiguous correlation between some indicators and the subject of assessment or related criteria, and between sub-indicators and indicators, is questionable.

Consistence (logical framework)

The project was designed according to the hierarchy of the logical framework. The different levels of the logical structure were consistently distinguished. However the application of these levels leaves room for improvement.

The five specific objectives could have been combined into two or three objectives. Outputs comprise more substance than reference to reports (plots established rather than a report on established plots).

Project development process

The project development process distinctly demonstrates a supply driven process. However, little documentation on the actual process of project development was available. The influence of USDA and the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) dominates but that of BIOTROP, Indonesian government departments, provincial and district authorities, forest managers and other forest-related actors and stakeholders, is less apparent. Involvement of these actors was insufficient at the inception of the project to assure full consent with project design and unconditional preparedness to integrate the developed monitoring method into the NFI system, but involvement appears to have increased as the project progressed.

Participation of stakeholders

The influence of BIOTROP and USDA dominates but that of Indonesian government departments, provincial and district authorities, forest managers and other forest-related actors and stakeholders, is less apparent. Involvement of these actors was insufficient at the inception of the project to assure full consent with project design and unconditional preparedness to integrate the developed monitoring method into the NFI system, but involvement appears to have increased as the project progressed.

Efficiency

The **project team** gives the impression to be **highly motivated** and familiar with the aims, strategies and procedures of the project. The project team showed a **high**

standard of training. The **NFI management staff** might have had a greater input in organisational aspects in the project. Frequent personnel turnover in MOF did not benefit the project process or the effective transfer of knowledge

The support of the **US team** seemed to have faded out during project implementation, reportedly, for political reasons.

A comparison of work input between NFI and FHM plots has indicated a considerably higher input per unit area in the FHM plots. This **relatively high input** may be the result of the use of **less efficient instruments** and laborious techniques and the academic nature of the project design and narrow focus. These impediments could be partly mitigated by closer cooperation and the envisaged full integration of the FHM process in the broader context of the NFI process and network. Nonetheless these impediments caution against an increase of sampling intensity (density of plots, frequency of re-measurement).

The **Steering Committee** members are selected from a narrow professional segment. Major stakeholder and interest groups are not yet represented.

The requested and allocated **funds** were not sufficient to meet the ambitious targets of the project. As a result the project was partly lacking efficient sampling and monitoring instruments and not all outputs were achieved. The very comprehensive audit reports by an independent auditor give evidence of prudent spending within the estimates and testimony of conformity with International Accounting Standards.

Effectiveness and impact

The development objective, see project description above, seems very ambitious and only realistic if one is able to draft a **feasible blueprint of the resources**, means, social environment and political will necessary to accomplish this objective. The question is also **what policy options the GOI may have** to respond to the information, which will be compiled from the monitoring process.

Awareness has been created with the forest department and some local governments of the significance of monitoring the condition of the forests and for the need to step up the NFI from timber inventory to a more comprehensive inventory reflecting more of the elements which constitute SFM.

The project has provided a basis for a common perception and a practical interpretation of SFM by BIOTROP, LEI, CIFOR, MOF, forest managers.

The technology transfer has been rather well accomplished, methods have been developed and indicators tested and partly validated for monitoring productivity, biodiversity, vitality and site conditions.

Thirty-seven detection monitoring plots have been established, including 10 demonstration and 5 training plots, and additionally, 17 plots by MOF in Kalimantan. Companies use plots in the FMU as instruction plots for **tree species identification**. Forest Damage Inventory is a new subject in the **Diploma Programme** in Forest Protection, Bogor Agriculture University. The project **has trained 129 staff members** from 10 regional offices of the Forest Inventory and Planning division and **50 scientists** - 36 from Indonesia and 14 from other ASEAN countries.

The established 54 plots and future additions, when monitored well, provide a valuable basis for **ecological information and research**, such as the study of population dynamics and soil genesis. The technical value for research could be further enhanced if expanded to include socio-economic parameters.

Dissemination of project results

Project results on proceedings of technology were published, in English, through 29 **technical reports** in 3 volumes, which have been sent to ten regions. From two locations, as a pilot exercise, data were analysed and processed into a format relevant to policy makers. Some training material was produced in Bahasa Indonesia. However the project has not developed far enough to disseminate practical monitoring manuals and meaningful information based on the outcome of data collecting, processing and analysis.

Not accomplished outputs of the project proposal:

- Technology transfer on linking remote sensing techniques to ground-based NFI plots.
- Data processing and system analysis linking socio-economic parameters with the results of forest monitoring.
- Training at all levels and across stakeholders (academia, forest inventory, government, forest managers, local population).
- Effective transfer of relevant information to target groups beyond those directly involved.
- Preparation of monitoring manuals.

Sustainability of interventions

Experience has already shown that there is a chronic threat that FHM and NFI plots are damaged or destroyed completely by fire, illegal commercial logging and interference by local people in the form of cultivation, timber theft or vandalism.

The sustainability of FHM is linked to the sustainability of the NFI which depends on government's policy and its enforcement.

Demonstration value

The overall concept is feasible and relevant to national needs and interests. The two demonstration plots are well chosen and established, but require review with respect to the underlying assumptions of simple correlations.

3.3 Forest, Science and Sustainability: The Bulungan Model Forest Kalimantan, Indonesia (PD 12/97 Rev.1)

Project description

Background

In 1996, the Indonesian Ministry of Forestry (MOF) designated 321,000 hectares of forest for The Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR) in East Kalimantan known as the "Bulungan Research Forest (BRF) to be developed as a long-term model of exemplary research-based sustainable forest management. The BRF lies within the district of Malinau, East Kalimantan. The area is adjacent to the Kayan Mentarang National Park. Actual research is carried out in the watersheds of the Malinau and Tubu river, outside the BFR. The BFR serves as a protected area, where no legal logging or management takes place and virtually no research is done.

Development objective

"To achieve long-term forest management for multiple uses, integrating social and silvicultural aspects". The project would constitute a development phase within a longer-term research strategy.

Specific objectives and outputs

- Assessment of the effect of Reduced-Impact Logging on biodiversity, conservation, ecology and socio-economics. Originally with 7 outputs, two of them were merged.
- Assessment of rural development trends and future policy options, including the effects of macro-level development activities on people dependent on the forest. Originally with 5 outputs which were merged into two outputs.

Project duration: 1 September 1997 – 30 December 2000, extended to 30 December 2001. Final report January 2002. A follow-up project has been approved and funded by ITTO.

Midterm evaluation: May 2001

ITTO contribution: \$ 965,650 conform project proposal, and an additional budget of US\$ 130,740.

Implementing agencies

Center for International Forestry Research, CIFOR, in cooperation with the Agency for Forest Research and Development, FORDA, of the Indonesian Ministry of Forest, MOF.

*Evaluation highlights***Project Design***Strategic value*

The dynamics of the region, logging activities, migration of villages, coal mining, agricultural expansion, road construction and traditional forest uses, make it, at first sight, challenging for socio-economic studies. At the same time the complexity may be exceptional. This factor together with the remoteness makes the area not the logical first choice for a research and demonstration site. These facts have reduced the strategic value of the project.

Consistence (logical framework)

The project proposal follows the hierarchical structure of the logical framework. The different levels of the framework were consistently distinguished (development objective, specific objectives, outputs and activities). However indicators to measure the achievements were not identified. In some cases the coherence of outputs in relation to the specific objectives could have been more thoroughly elaborated. Also, proposed outputs were too ambitious for the proposed inputs of the project.

The budget was not based on accurate estimates of a detailed work plan and has undervalued various items.

Project development process

CIFOR staff has taken the initiative to formulate the project proposal which was submitted by the Government of Indonesia to ITTO. Coordination within CIFOR was not optimal. Formulated outputs and activities did not result from an integrated project formulation process but rather from drafts from individuals and separate departments. Too little is reported on the project formulation process. The Stated-owned company PT INHUTANI II was not directly involved in the development and implementation of the

project. Local communities were actively involved in the implementation phase of the project.

Participation of stakeholders

Important stakeholders of the project were the local communities, who were satisfactorily involved and assisted by the project in the preparation of mapping their community boundaries. The awareness generated through this effort has served as an important basis for the position of local communities in discussing decentralization, regional laws and land use rights. The Stated-owned company PT INHUTANI II was not directly involved in the development and implementation of the project. The RIL experiments were conducted by researchers while INHUTANI II provided equipment and personnel for the execution of the logging activities.

Efficiency

Project staff and researchers were capable to cope with unforeseen circumstances and to adapt to rapidly changing political and economic environments.

Coordination within CIFOR was not optimal, however during the course of the implementation, cooperation and coordination improved at least between the community oriented scientists. Cooperation with other international programs or ITTO projects in the region seemed not to have been sought.

Much of the project leader's time was consumed by project management, (coordination, logistics, finance, administration) and communication with stakeholders, leaving little time for organizing and supervising the research components.

The **Steering Committee** (SC) should have met more frequently to take necessary decisions in time. To enhance its efficiency project staff suggests that the SC should consist of a small number of professionals who will be actively involved in steering and supervising the implementation of the project. In addition a broader forum of stakeholders might be established to serve as a "sounding board" for project management.

The project implementation suffered from substantial **budget under-estimates** and the financial crisis. Through considerable financial and staff contributions from CIFOR and other project partners and donors, the project succeeded remarkably well to offset the encountered financial constraints.

Effectiveness and impact

The two specific objectives, as described in the project document, were mostly achieved but certain aspects were only partly accomplished. The assessment of impacts on biodiversity was partially achieved, while those on soils and environment were not realized due to the lack of baseline maps and other geographic information and time constraints for conducting the research on the ground.

The assessment of the role and importance of forest products for local communities was achieved. People's dependencies on forest and forest products was determined.

The project was effective in achieving sound results such as the highly informative **technical report**, containing a wealth of facts and vision that should stir policy makers to take action.

The project increased **awareness** among forest dependent people and local authorities regarding location and extent of villages (mapping) and environmental damages. But insufficient precautions have been taken with the mapping exercise to avoid the **risk of raising false expectations** as to land use and ownership rights.

The project demonstrated that application of **RIL** in the first cutting cycle is economically viable and provides a residual stand, in contrast to conventional logging (CNV), with enough stock for a successful harvest of quality timber in the second cutting cycle. A substantial number of people from concessionaires and government has been trained in the application of RIL.

The impact of the project results and of the activities is very much negatively affected by the present **political situation** in Indonesia and the **socio-economic situation** in the project region. This is expressed in the chapter on “People’s Dependencies on Forests” in the technical report.

Quote “Traders take advantage of the hunter-gatherer's consumerist tendencies. Most collectors are trapped in debts and thus obliged to sell their products to a specific trader. A general trend comes to light. This trend comes from forest product gathering to agricultural activities and to salaried activities. Salaried jobs are set aside for skilled and educated personnel. The main drawback at the moment is the rapid development of IPPK's. Villagers are offered royalties by 'investors' for the logging of so called traditional forests. The lure of easy money is the main driving force. Forest is no longer considered as essential for making a living but rather as a source for easy money. The dominant perception is that forest will disappear anyway, so better take one's share as quickly as possible. At present rates of deforestation there will be no forest left in the Malinau district in 12 years from now”. Unquote.

Dissemination of project results

Technical report Phase 1 contains **high quality and easily readable reports in English**. Most individual reports strike a **fair balance** between sound scientific information and popular presentation of the message. Newsletters in Bahasa Indonesia have been issued after community meetings and workshops. Pictorial RIL guidelines in English wait for translation in Bahasa Indonesia. However, an overall Dissemination and Extension Strategy was badly missing to accomplish further outreach and uptake.

Not accomplished outputs of original proposal

- Improvements of the current Indonesian forest management system, **incorporation of RIL into** the Indonesian selective tree felling and tree plant system **TPTI**.
- Application of **RIL in practice**.
- Spatially-referenced **data base** of target groups of **plant and animal species**.
- **Effective transfer** of relevant information to target groups.
- Developments of **future scenario's** for the region.

Sustainability of intervention

The passage of Law 41 on decentralization has increased illegal logging to unprecedented volumes. District governments issue 100 ha cutting permits, or IPPK's, indiscriminately to local businessmen even inside existing concession areas. Local communities have little choice but taking their share and negotiate compensations with local businessmen for logging on “ their” lands. Expansion of mining activities and

construction of new roads to provide access for remote villagers to education and health services will further build up pressure on the forests. Definition and implementation by the government of a “ development policy” for the Malinau and the Tubu watersheds, is badly needed.

RIL and CNV permanent plots are worthwhile to be secured and monitored. It is recommended that staff members of MOF and CIFOR pursue government decision makers on the necessity to set aside this area by a legal instrument.

Demonstration value

The Bulungan research forest has only limited suitability to serve as a demonstration area. Accessibility is a major constraint. (airplanes, boat, car). The **research forest** itself serves as a **protected area**, where no legal logging takes place and virtually **no research** is done. Presently there is also in the adjacent area little to demonstrate. The RIL plots could be developed as a demonstration area but they **lack the context** of a larger forest management unit with a **responsible management authority**. However the **Malinau watershed could serve as a representative example** of a forest development area, but not necessarily to demonstrate SFM.

3.4 A Demonstration Program of Sustainable Utilization of Tropical Forests by Means of Differentiated Management in Hainan Island, China – Phase I, II and III, China, (PD 14/92 Rev.2)

Project description

Background/location

Global concern on the conservation of biodiversity and the malpractices of forest exploitation has triggered a great deal of theoretical research in China on how to realize both the protection and the wise utilization of China's tropical and sub-tropical forests. The project is set up to turn the theory into practice and to demonstrate that the contradiction between protection and utilization could be solved. The province of Hainan Island was selected as project site. A two year survey of prevailing ecological, social and economic conditions on Hainan Island preceded the formulation of the project. The project was approved in its three phases at the Fourteenth Session of the ITTC, in May 1993. Finance was secured for each phase separately after completion of the earlier phase.

Development objective.

Not explicitly formulated in the project proposal. It could be deduced from the completion report and the subprojects as follows:

“To promote sustainable management of tropical and even subtropical forests in China in the broader context of sustainable economic (rural) development”.

Specific Objectives and outputs

Specific objectives were implicitly formulated by means of 6 sub-projects which could be grouped under two reconstructed specific objectives:

- Development of demonstration areas for integrated forest and other land use management: tropical forest plantation; sustainable management of the tropical nature forests; tropical agro-silvo-pastoral artificial system; protection of the tropical virgin forests. Activities were formulated, no outputs.
- Development of human resources and knowledge: information investigation and research; development of human resources and the exemplary extension. Activities were formulated no outputs.

Project duration: 1 July 1993 – 30 June 1998, extended to 30 December 2001.
Completion report March 2003.

Midterm evaluation: March 1998 to review Phase II.

An independent consultant was engaged in and to develop the workplan of Phase III.

ITTO contribution: \$3,000,000 conform project proposal, and an additional budget of US\$ 280,000 for the third phase.

Implementing agencies

Forestry Bureau of Hainan Province in cooperation with the Chinese Academy of Forestry.

Evaluation highlights

Design

Strategic value

The project was strategically well designed. The objective to achieve sustainable forest management of tropical forest in China in the broader context of sustainable economic (rural) development was relevant and the project was timely to pursue this objective.

Partnerships (Chinese Academy of Forestry, Forestry Bureau of Hainan Province, Forestry County Bureaus and villages) and full commitment were created to ensure an effective and smooth implementation.

In some areas the integration of subprojects was well planned along the gradient from virgin forest in higher elevations, to agro-silvo land utilisation types and plantations on the lower slopes and valleys. The compensation for deprived income of forest workers, as a result of the ban on logging, by creating new sources of income through enhanced agricultural and tourism activities, was crucial for the successful protection of virgin forests.

The project design seemed somewhat flawed regarding the spatial planning of plantations and the rationale for RIL experiments. The planning criteria for plantations were not well understood by the evaluation team.

Consistency (logical framework)

The project was designed prior to the condensation of the accumulated experience of ITTO in its Manual for Project Formulation, Second Edition, of 1999. Consequently the project design lacks the rigid structure of a logical framework including indicators to measure the achievements. Nonetheless the project proposal enables a reformulation in accordance with the basic elements of a logical framework.

Development and specific objectives and outputs had not been explicitly formulated. Instead six subprojects were formulated with an infinite number of activities, which sometimes appeared to be outputs. As a consequence of this endless number of detailed activities the project proposal appeared somewhat like workplan.

The **phased approach** of the project provided insight in the follow-up of each phase. It also allowed for necessary adjustments in the proposal and budget for the follow-up phase, which had to be submitted to ITTO.

The **budget estimates** for the first and second phase appeared to be correct. The estimated budget for the third phase was considered far too low. Due to changing circumstances during the long period between first estimation and implementation considerable revisions had to be made.

Project development process

The project was formulated on the basis of a two year socio-economic and ecological survey, financed by WWF. However, too little is reported on the outcome of this survey and the project formulation process itself. It is not clear who, what institutes and which representatives of villagers have been involved in project formulation. However there seemed great interest, support and cooperation with all the groups who were involved in the implementation. The commitment and participation of stakeholders such as county governments, local communities, forest workers, during the implementation stage was one of the reasons for the success of the project.

Participation of stakeholders

The commitment and participation of stakeholders during the implementation stage was one of the reasons for the success of the project. Local communities (villagers) had an input and were assisted by the project during its implementation stage. Of particular relevance to them were the subprojects on tropical agro-silvo-pastoral ecosystem and on tropical plantations. Also, loggers, being employees of the Hainan Forest Bureau, benefited from assistance to find alternative sources of income while the log ban in natural forests became effective. Institutional stakeholders, mainly County forest bureau staff and personnel, showed much interest in the project and supported and executed activities at field level.

Efficiency

The project development and implementation is characterized by an **exceptionally strong commitment** from all levels in the administration of China, i.e. national, provincial, and county level as well as from the local communities. The overall management responsibility has to be in one hand and was assigned to Hainan Forestry Bureau, but the project has benefited from a strong cooperation with the Chinese Academy of Forestry.

The **Steering Committee** was composed of many members representing various stakeholders and met once a year. County forestry bureaus were not, but should have been represented in the Steering Committee.

Direct communication between the Hainan Forest Bureau and ITTO and direct transmission of funds from ITTO to Hainan Forest Bureau has facilitated smooth project implementation. The phased approach accommodates necessary revisions of the **budget** which is a prerequisite for projects with a long duration.

Effectiveness and impact

The general objective “To promote sustainable management of tropical and even subtropical forests in China in the broader context of sustainable economic (rural) development” justifies the project completely. The two specific objectives, as constructed by the evaluation team, and the outputs of the project were satisfactorily achieved. The effectiveness and the impact of the project are demonstrated by an impressive array of achievements.

The project has prompted an **innovative approach in China**, including the concept of **classified forest management**, towards achieving SFM in the broader context of sustainable economic (rural) development. Substantial new knowledge about Hainan and China forestry issues and timber market has been produced and stored. **Reduced Impact Logging** experiments have contributed to the awareness of SFM and has increased confidence in the application of SFM techniques.

The project has already considerably changed forest management on Hainan Island. While changes in forest **policy** (ban on logging natural forests) had been approved by the parliament prior to the start of the ITTO project, the project itself was **instrumental for the implementation** of the natural forest protection program. The project has promoted the interest in the protection and created the conditions (scientific data) for **expansion** of the Bawangling and the Jianfengling Nature Reserve. Locally, the **income** of villagers has risen substantially as a result of the implementation of newly developed land utilization types.

Results of the project activities are **visible at sites**, featuring tropical forest plantations; results of RIL experiments in tropical natural forest; tropical agro-silvo-pastoral ecosystems; and protection of tropical virgin forests.

A **Training Center** has been established and is fully integrated in the Hainan Forestry Bureau.

A substantial number of people has been trained, staff of the Hainan Provincial Forestry Bureau the County Forestry Bureaus, some of the State Forestry Administration, and local population.

The work on stand improvement and – establishment has resulted in **plantations** of *Eucalyptus* species and varieties, which produce ten times more than plantations that had been established prior to the project. Companies are increasing their plantation area

mainly with *Eucalyptus* and a **pulp and paper mill** is being built in response to these new prospects.

However, the nearly indiscriminate establishment of *Eucalyptus* plantations should be questioned. The rationale for establishing almost exclusively pulpwood plantations was not clear. Risks of draught and of the negative effects on the lower areas when *Eucalyptus* is planted on plateaus seem to be estimated as only moderate.

The project Completion and Technical Report and separate project reports contain a valuable vision and facts on forest use and values. They provide, together with the pre-project land survey and the project activity sites, an excellent basis for a master **land use plan for Hainan**.

Dissemination of project results

The project has produced a magnitude of publications, reports and documents in Chinese and 8 major publications in English. To accomplish further outreach and uptake a **Dissemination and Extension Strategy** is necessary.

Not accomplished outputs of original proposal

In the absence of concrete formulated outputs and indicators for achievement no accurate measure is available. The impression is that virtually all anticipated activities have been executed with satisfactory results.

Sustainability of interventions

Project experiments and pilot activities cover four important aspects of rural development and conservation; tropical plantations, SFM schemes for natural (secondary) forests, agro-silvo-pastoral ecosystems, and protection of pristine natural forest including tourism and research. A strong feature is that the project has demonstrated the inter-linkage of these aspects in practice. The project has established the foundation for the development and implementation of a Master Land use plan for Hainan province. The support of the federal and provincial governments, industries and all interested institutions and (donor)organizations for follow-up actions is required for expanding the impact of the project findings and achievements.

Demonstration value

Regarding the actual management of natural forest for timber the project has little to offer, the **RIL site is isolated** and lacks the context of an ongoing forest operation. Some of the **plantations and the nursery** have demonstration or instruction value but they resemble rather technical methods and experiments than an example of management of a vast area. However the **entire gradient of Jianfengling national park** including the **adjacent area** has a great potential to serve as demonstration area. The **linkage and interactions** between the management of the national park (conservation, education, tourism) and the adjacent areas (changed sources of income) could well be demonstrated. This requires however development of specific activities such as producing information material and facilities to guide visitors who want to learn about the solutions and interactions.

5. FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This chapter highlights lessons and draws conclusions from the findings as they are presented in the separate evaluation reports of the four projects and in chapter 3 of this synthesis report. A major criterion for the identification of issues to observe and to conclude on is the relevance to ITTO in its capacity of project funder and manager.

Specific emphasis is laid upon commonalities between the projects to support general conclusions. Although the four projects have in common that they are formulated to help achieve sustainable forest management, their focus and approach are rather diverse. In fact only the Model Forest Management Area project in Sarawak, Malaysia has been initiated to bring about sustainable forest management at timber concession unit level. The Bulungan model forest project, East Kalimantan, Indonesia is basically a watershed study area with possible implications for future developments. The Demonstration program in Hainan-Island, China is focussing on the development and implementation of interlinked policy instruments at a variety of locations. Finally the Forest Health Monitoring project in Indonesia is a research and monitoring project to support the Government of Indonesia with information on the nation wide condition of the forests. Monitor plots are dispersed over the nation. These differences limit to a certain extent the possibilities to draw general conclusions.

5.1 Appropriateness of design

Proper design of the project is a key to smooth implementation and success in terms of achieving project objectives and anticipated impact. Three particular aspects are distinguished; the strategic value, the consistence (logical framework) and the development process of the project proposal. Thorough consideration and careful elaboration of each of these aspects is crucial for the quality of the design and consequently for the potential of a successful project.

Strategic value

Strategic value of the project design has been defined by the evaluation team as “the potential of the project to contribute effectively to its development objective, and the relevance and feasibility of that development objective”. Strategic value is determined by matters such as; clarity and relevance of the specific objectives, complexity of the project, representativeness, accessibility and socio-economic situation of project location, and choice of project partners.

Projects scored diversely with respect to **clarity of objectives and feasibility of the development objective**. In the case of PD 16/95, Hainan, China, the (implicit) development objective was relevant and feasible and the (implicit) project objectives were linked and well tuned to this objective. This was also the case for Projects 105/90 and Project 14/95 MFMA Sarawak, Malaysia. The feasibility of the development objective of Project PD 16/95 Forest Health Monitoring, Indonesia is questionable and the project objective was diffuse, resulting in some confusion as to the hierarchy of attributes to be monitored and the relevance of some activities. The specific objectives of PD 12/97 Bulungan, Indonesia were not strongly linked and related to a rather weakly formulated development objective. This was, at least partly, cause for little coherence between outputs of the project.

The more **complex** a project is, the higher the risk that management can not cope with it. The MFMA is an example where project design has contributed to a high degree of complexity. Where the project area should have been confined to one concession area including surrounding areas of its influence, the MFMA includes many concessions, even straddling the boundaries. This implies an unnecessary great number of actors in the project and points of attention for project management. This has been reflected in some loss of grip and control of the project management, and insufficient commitment with some actors. The Hainan case was also complex in a sense that the project was very ambitious, but complexity was not unnecessarily increased by the project design. In this case the project could cope with the complexity through a strong project management structure and capacity.

Complexity may also be inherent to an area which has been chosen to implement the project. For instance in the case of the Malinou watershed (Bulungan forest) too many uncontrolled factors may make the project less feasible.

As to **representation** of project sites all projects seem to score fairly well. This does not mean that the **locations** are optimal from a view of project management and the ability to serve as demonstration areas. Notably the access to Bulungan Forest is cumbersome and costly. In most projects monitoring and sample plots lose their value as accessibility and protection decreases with time.

That the choice of project **partners** is crucial for success is demonstrated by the Hainan project where a combination of the responsible government agency, Forestry Bureau of Hainan Province which has the power to develop and implement policies, and a research organisation, Chinese Academy of Forestry which brings in the knowledge and technologies, implemented the project. Further down the line the partnership with Forestry County Bureaus and villages proved to be an additional strong feature for effective implementation on the ground. The MFMA project showed that too many actors which are not real partners rather tend to hamper the project than to support the project. The Bulungan project was in this respect characterised by too much concentration of ownership with the Executing Agency. The partnership between BIOTROP and the USDA in the FHM project failed to last and jeopardized part of the project execution.

Consistency (logical framework)

All projects were designed prior to the condensation of the accumulated experience of ITTO in its Manual for Project Formulation, Second Edition, of 1999. Formulation of most projects lacked the benefit of a well-structured logical framework, which would have facilitated proper linkage and integration of activities and monitoring of achievements by means of indicators. In one case (Hainan) development and specific objectives and outputs had not been explicitly formulated. Instead 6 subprojects were formulated with an infinite number of activities, which sometimes appeared to be outputs. Other projects, Bulungan, Indonesia, and FHM, Indonesia, distinguished the different levels of the logical framework structure, (development objective, specific objectives, outputs and activities) properly. But then, the application of these levels (FHM project) or the coherence between outputs and specific objectives (Bulungan project) leave room for improvement. Outputs should represent the substance of the produce of the project. In various cases however outputs were formulated in terms of reports and publications (35 plots established rather than a report on established plots). Also proposed outputs were too ambitious for the proposed inputs of the projects. None

of the projects had formulated indicators to measure the achievements and effectiveness of the project.

Budgets were more than once based upon estimates of inaccurately elaborated activities and had undervalued various items. The longer the duration of the project the less accurate activities can be described and cost estimates be made.

Phased approach of projects proved to mitigate this problem of long term forecasting. Presentation of a full project proposal divided in two or more phases provide insight in the follow-up of each phase while financial commitment is sought for each phase separately after completion of the prior phase. The phased approach also allowed for necessary adjustments in the proposal and budget for the follow-up phase, which had to be submitted to ITTO.

All projects, including the phased Hainan project and the MFMA (first phase), Sarawak, were **extended** beyond the anticipated time horizon in the project proposal. This reflects under-estimation of required time to execute activities and to approve and fund follow-up phases.

Project development process

None, or little documentation on the actual process of project development was available. This impeded the ability of the evaluation team to assess the degree of involvement of stakeholders right at the beginning of project formulation. A feeling of ownership right at the formulation of the project facilitates and strengthens commitment, cooperation and proactive participation during the implementation and even after the termination of the project. Two science based projects (FHM and Bulungan) distinctly demonstrate a supply driven process with not fully adequate involvement of important partners with project implementation. This caused some resistance to integrate the monitoring system in the national inventory system (FHM) and a stand aside attitude of the concessionaire in which concession RIL experiments were carried out (Bulungan).

However, the evaluation team has the impression that during the implementation of the projects successful, albeit time and energy consuming, efforts were made to raise interest and commitment of stakeholders such as, local communities, farmers, concession holders and national government agencies and local governments.

CONCLUSIONS Project design

- 1) Matters which determine the **strategic value** of a project are **not always explicitly addressed** or given serious attention. This has proven to hamper efficient implementation and to weaken the ability of projects to effectively contribute to their respective development objective.
- 2) **Relevant and feasible development objectives and precise formulation of specific objectives** and consequently using the same terminology are important prerequisites for an unambiguous well understood project.
- 3) Use of a **logical framework** facilitates project design and contributes to coherence and transparency but is **no guarantee for the consistency** between activities, the anticipated outputs and objectives.
- 4) A feeling of ownership right at the formulation of the project facilitates and strengthens commitment and co-operation during the implementation. Supply

driven projects (and/or **science oriented projects**) tend to **overlook the importance of seriously involving stakeholders** with the formulation of the project.

- 5) The project **development process** is often not transparent and not **documented**.
- 6) **Project implementation and effectiveness benefits from a combination of implementing agencies and organisations**, which cover responsibility for national/regional policy formulation and implementation, research and science, and on the ground implementation.
- 7) Careful **site selection** is crucial for efficient and effective project implementation.
- 8) **Integration and spatial linking** of conservation and income generating measures and activities are a key to successful conservation projects.
- 9) Projects with a duration longer than 3 to 4 years benefit from a **phased approach** (division in two or more phases, which are separately submitted for approval and funding). Phased approach provides insight in the follow-up of each phase. It also allows for necessary adjustments in the proposal and budget for the follow-up phase.

RECOMMENDATIONS Project design

- 2) Executing Agencies: Avoid areas for project implementation with exceptionally complex natural, logistic and administrative conditions, do not add unnecessary complicity regarding number of actors and responsible local governments through delineation of the project area.
- 2) Executing agencies: Apply a logical framework to assure consistency of the project design and accord of anticipated objectives with outputs
- 3) Executing Agencies: Full commitment and proactive participation from those actors who should play indispensable roles during later stages of the project or even after project completion must be vested during the formulation phase and maintained during the implementation phase.
- 4) Executing Agencies: Cost estimates of facilities and activities and the time required to achieve planned outputs should be as realistic as possible.
- 5) ITTO, Executing Agencies: The project development process should be documented in particular with respect to involvement of stakeholders and the degree to which ownership is perceived.
- 6) Executing Agencies: Project design and implementation should secure integration and spatial linkage of measures and activities of one project.

4.2 Participation, stakeholder involvement

While stakeholder consultations during the project preparation had been in all cases insufficient, efforts were made to increase involvement and participation during the implementation of the

projects. This could not prevent that crucial support and cooperation of some stakeholders did not build up.

CONCLUSION Participation, stakeholder involvement

- 10) Involvement and evident input in the development phase of the project creates a sense of shared ownership, which provide a firm basis for proactive cooperation during and beyond the implementation phase.

4.3 Efficiency

Efficiency is the amount of input (such as, quality and time of human resources, equipment and funds,) relative to the achieved outputs. **Efficiency** of project execution is for a great deal **conditioned by project design**. (see 4.1) In the project proposal the choices have been made as to the management structure, partners, division of responsibilities, project sites, availability and allocation of funds etc.

The projects have produced a great deal of the envisaged outputs but only after **extension of the implementation period and with additional funds**.

Failures in achieving the full set of outputs were mainly caused by inappropriate design, underestimation of costs and unrealistic time tables. In some cases inefficiency in coordination by implementing agencies was a constraint. Also the **complexity** of socio-economic, institutional and administrative conditions at the project site (MFMA Sarawak, Bulungan East Kalimantan) has been an obstacle to achieving constructive dialogue and efficiency of cooperation.

Frequent personnel turnover has in some cases impeded project process or the effective transfer of knowledge.

Lack of a local office and **permanent presence** at the project site resulted in less control and indifference of partners and stakeholders. Much of the project leader's time is consumed by project management, (coordination, logistics, finance, administration) and communication with stakeholders. This leaves, notably in cases where research is an important project component, too little time for monitoring quality and steering outputs.

International consultants, did not always fulfil expectations, which impeded the realisation of some crucial objectives.

Cooperation with other international programs or ITTO projects in the region was weak or not existing at all. This is a lost opportunity as projects or programs, including the evaluated ITTO projects, in the same area and with similar objectives would have benefited from more intensive exchange of experiences and possible joint efforts.

Information on **Steering Committee** functioning was generally positive, although in the case of Bulungan suggestions were made that the Steering Committee should have been composed of a smaller number of people representing only committed institutions. The Steering Committee, having the decision making power over project implementation, should meet as frequent as the progress of the project requires. Steering committees must not been seen as an information forum. Other instruments should be used to keep stakeholders informed and involved.

Budget estimates fall in most cases short compared to reality. Causes are underestimation of required time to execute activities and inaccurate and incomplete listing of all relevant budget items including travel costs, facilities and equipment. But also external factors as currency fluctuations and financial crises have influenced the availability of funds. Direct communication on financial matters and transfer of funds between ITTO and project management favors smooth release of necessary funds to the project account and smooth project implementation.

CONCLUSIONS Efficiency

- 11) The projects have produced a great deal of the envisaged outputs but only after **extension of the implementation period and with additional funds.**
- 12) **Efficiency** of project execution is to a great extent **conditioned by project design** including accurate estimation of budgets.
- 13) **Full commitment and support at all levels of the executing agency** and strong linkages between the executing agencies and the involved actors in the district and in the field proved to be an important condition for assuring smooth and efficient project implementation.
- 14) Local office and **permanent presence** at the project site are a prerequisite for efficient implementation.
- 15) Opportunities for cooperation with other ITTO projects and (international) programmes have hardly been used.
- 16) **Steering Committees**, provided they are small and determined to execute their task, are indispensable project governance tools.
- 17) Adequate (scientific) knowledge of **consultants** is no guarantee for ample practical “hands-on” experiences and ability to advise in practical concrete situations.

RECOMMENDATIONS Efficiency

- 7) ITTO, Executing Agencies: promote more intensive communication and cooperation with other similar ITTO projects and relevant (international) programmes in the area.
- 8) Executing Agencies: Secure permanent presence of project management at the project site.
- 9) ITTO, Executing Agencies: Steering committees must not be seen as an information forum. Other instruments should be used to keep stakeholders informed and involved.

4.4 Effectiveness, Achievements and Impact

Effectiveness of a project may be expressed by its contribution to the development objective, while the relevance to ITTO of the development objective itself may also be taken into account. Therefore, effectiveness should be measured by assessing the relevance of the development objective, the relevance of the project's specific objectives to the development objective and the consistence of outputs with the specific objective. This is in the first place a **matter of project design** (see 4.1), and in the second place a matter of efficient implementation (see 4.3).

The projects have produced a great deal of their anticipated outputs. Another matter is what **impact** these outputs and the very existence of the project and its activities have had on policy, landuse and attitude and actions of actors in the forest sector and the livelihood of local population. In general, Government Agencies and Executing Agencies perceived the projects positive and referred to the indispensable support of ITTO in executing the projects. Responses of concession holders and logging companies were mixed. Positive reactions could be registered from local communities who were supported by exploring and applying more income generating land use practices.

It is noticeable that all projects have created **more awareness** with various target groups, such as government agencies, concession holders and local population including forest dwellers, on the urgency and feasibility to change forest management and monitor the condition of the forest. Promising examples of **residual stands** after application of **RIL** has contributed to this awareness (MFMA and Bulungan). If RIL will be adopted widely, remains to be seen. Even if calculations indicate that the cost of RIL may be slightly lower than those of conventional logging, the burden on management to create the conditions for RIL implementation may be too great an obstacle.

Some projects presented impressive **training results** (FHM and Hainan). The impact of trained people depends on the application of the acquired knowledge and skills in practice and with policy development. In this respect the messages from the FHM and Hainan project were promising.

Various projects have had **unanticipated positive side effects** such as the extension of national parks and the establishment of wood processing industries on Hainan Island, and the development of new curricula at the university (FHM, Bogor)

More detailed information can be read in the separate project reports. Firm statements on the magnitude and sustainability of impacts require more in depth assessment than the available time of the evaluation team would allow. The team is however convinced that outreach could have been more profound if projects would have developed and implemented a more explicit **dissemination and extension strategy**. It was disappointing to establish that all projects were lacking such a strategy. As a consequence, information, reports and publications were not always appropriate for each individual target group and did not reach further than directly involved stakeholders.

The ultimate impact on forest management practices remains however trivial in situations where law enforcement is weak or lacking and the forest sector continues to

be dominated by a few powerful timber holdings guided by short term profit considerations rather than by long term sustainability. Likewise, situations with a vacuum in government competence and confusion about use rights, give greed for easy money ample opportunity to have its way.

CONCLUSIONS Effectiveness, achievements and impact

- 18) The projects have produced a great deal of their anticipated outputs and specific objectives.
- 19) The effectiveness and potential impact of a project is to a great extent determined in the **design phase** of the project.
- 20) Awareness of urgency and feasibility to change forest policy and management has become stronger as a result of the ITTO projects.
- 21) Executing agencies and local communities have clearly benefited from the projects. For other stakeholders such as timber associations and concession holders benefits were less univocal.
- 22) Training components are indispensable for transfer of knowledge and skills and for securing sustainability after project completion.
- 23) Projects have achieved unanticipated positive side effects.
- 24) Projects have insufficiently elaborated extension and dissemination mechanisms.

RECOMMENDATION Effectiveness, achievements and impact

- 10) ITTO and Executing Agencies: A dissemination and extension strategy should be an integral part of each project proposal. The strategy should elaborate on ways and means of dissemination and transfer of information and skills to defined target groups.

4.5 Sustainability of Interventions

In all cases the same observation was made, agencies were eager to go on with similar activities but continuation was considered to be entirely depending on further financial support by ITTO or other donors. This means that the input of human resources, to continue similar activities and capitalize on the project achievements, seems only to be secured through external funding. This situation must be changed. One suggestion is to include in project proposals a post project implementation and extension phase which will be financed by the government and co-financed by ITTO.

Sustainability of the interventions are further threatened, depending on the type of project, by encroachment, illegal logging, vandalism, and fire.

CONCLUSIONS Sustainability of interventions

- 25) Recipient countries and Executing Agencies consider follow-up actions of completed projects too easily a matter of external funding.

- 26) Sustainability of interventions is jeopardized by this attitude and by lack of law enforcement and autonomous developments, such as encroachment and fires.

RECOMMENDATION Sustainability of interventions

- 11) ITTO: to include in project proposals a post project implementation and extension phase which will be financed by the government and co-financed by ITTO.

4.7 Effectiveness as demonstration area

The **concept of demonstration areas** stems from the early 1990s before forest certification came to life. The idea was that producer members would select one among the best managed forest areas for timber production in their countries to further step up the quality of forest management and to demonstrate the feasibility of high level forest management in practice. Three prerequisites should be fulfilled to achieve these objectives. First, the forest manager, often concessionaire, should be committed to **further improve forest management**. Second, the forest manager would allow interested parties to **visit his forest and to share information**. Third, an **information and extension** plan should be developed and implemented. The latter would be transmitted to ITTO for funding.

None of the project areas has reached the stage of a demonstration area.

Among the four evaluated projects only two, MFMA in Sarawak and Bulungan in East Kalimantan, could potentially, at first sight, be developed as a demonstration area for sustainable forest management including timber production.

Part of the MFMA, in particular the Zedtee area, could successfully be developed as a demonstration area. Even, yet prevailing, shortcomings in management and operations are instructive to demonstrate visibly the effects of errors and failures. The demonstration function of the Zedtee area needs to be operationalised by general information materials, technical and scientific publications and information sign-posting in the forest.

After a closer look at the reality of the **Bulungan** research forest one can not but conclude that the sustainability of the area to serve as a demonstration area for sustainable timber production is limited. Accessibility is a major constraint. The **research forest** itself serves as a **protected area**. The RIL plots could be developed as demonstration plots but they **lack the context** of a larger forest management unit. However, the **Malinau watershed could serve as a representative example** of a forest development area, but not necessarily to demonstrate SFM.

Regarding the actual management of natural forest for timber the Hainan project has little to offer. Yet, the **linkage and interactions** between the management of the **Jianfengling** national park (conservation, education, tourism) and the adjacent areas (changed sources of income) could well be demonstrated. This requires, however, development of specific activities such as producing information material and facilities to guide visitors who want to learn about the solutions and interactions.

The overall concept of **Forest Health Monitoring** is feasible and the two demonstration plots are well chosen and established. They have the potential to sustain and further develop as sources for information and training provided that the FHM system is further developed and that the underlying assumptions of simple correlations are being reviewed.

CONCLUSIONS Effectiveness as demonstration area

- 27) The aim of a demonstration area for timber production is to further step up the quality of forest management and to demonstrate the feasibility of high level forest management in practice. This requires an operational information and communication plan.
- 28) None of the project areas has reached the stage of a demonstration area. Those which have the potential based on present performance have no information and communication programme in place.
- 29) The Zedtee concession area within the present MFMA in Sarawak, has the potential to be developed successfully as a demonstration area.
The Malinau watershed, East Kalimantan could serve as a representative example of a forest development area, but not necessarily to demonstrate SFM.
The linkage and interactions between the management of the Jianfengling National Park , Hainan Island China,(conservation, education, tourism) and the adjacent areas (changed sources of income) could well be demonstrated.
Forest Health Monitoring is feasible and the two demonstration plots, West Java Indonesia are well chosen and established.

RECOMMENDATION Effectiveness as demonstration area

- 12) ITTO: ITTO should explore the willingness with the government of Sarawak/Malaysia and the concessionaire to develop the Zedtee concession as a demonstration area.

4.8 Contribution to the ITTO Objective 2000

ITTO objective 2000 refers to exports of wood and wood products from sustainably managed sources. So anything that contributes to the sustainable management of timber resources contributes potentially to objective 2000. It is clear that some activities contribute indirectly while other activities have a direct effect. The TOR of the mission explicitly asks to identify the contribution of projects as regards the implementation of the following priority actions:

Adopt a forest policy and apply legislation

The Hainan project induced further policy development and enforced new legislation (logging ban in natural forest). No contribution to sustainably produced timber.

Secure the permanent forest estate.

The Hainan project has further expanded and secured the protected forest area. No contribution to sustainably produced timber.

Apply reduced impact logging

MFMA scores positively. In Bulungan and Hainan RIL has not moved beyond the stages of experimental research sites.

Train the workforce, including supervisors, in RIL

The MFMA, Bulungan and the Hainan project all have trained forest workers, but little has been institutionalized.

Limit timber harvest to the sustained yield capacity

There is no evidence that any of the projects was yet successful in having forest agencies adjust their guidelines on timber harvesting based upon practical and scientific sound parameters.

Raise public awareness that timber harvesting can be consistent with the sustainability of tropical forests

The three projects with a RIL component, MFMA, Bulungan and Hainan, were all successful to raise awareness that RIL might be not only positive for the environment but also beneficiary for concession holders with a long term interest.

Focus forest research on the analysis and use of existing data and knowledge.

Projects showed no evidence to have implemented any activities in this respect. On the other hand the FHM project has used existing technologies to collect, process and analyze data. The FHM activities may be considered to indirectly contribute to objective 2000.

CONCLUSION Contribution to the ITTO objective 2000

- 30) Almost any activity pertaining directly or indirectly to sustainable management could be conceived as a contribution to ITTO objective 2000. It therefore loses its significance as a distinguishing factor for relevance of projects, unless criteria are developed, which indicate direct contributions to the achievement of objective 2000.
- 31) Most projects undertook activities and produced results which indirectly may be perceived to contribute to achieving ITTO objective 2000. Only one project

contributed directly by implementing more sustainable harvesting methods at a practical scale.

RECOMMENDATION Contribution to the ITTO objective 2000

- 13) ITTO: ITTO may wish to further develop criteria to determine what projects are perceived to contribute directly to achieving ITTO Objective 2000

5. CONCLUDING REMARKS

What is the added value of ex-post evaluations?

The Terms of Reference of this ex-post evaluation expect the team to assess all aspects of a project from its inception to the situation after its completion, such as administrative and financial matters, organization, communication, consultation and cooperation, technical matters, effectiveness and impact, relevance to ITTO etc. The task is to identify reasons for successes and failures. It is obvious that the short assigned time and even the combined competence of the team members do not allow to address all these items equally thoroughly.

Moreover separate assessments on financial issues, audit reports, already take place and should be continued. Occasional **more complete financial assessments**, including justification of budget items, may improve budget estimates and promote stronger financial discipline.

The question is what may be expected from an ex-post evaluation in addition to the wealth of information already made available through critical analysis and reviews and documented in completion reports and (interim) review reports. Almost without exception, these documents accurately present achievements, differences between anticipated outputs and realized outputs, availability and use of resources. They contain analyses, lessons learned (or still to be learned) conclusions and recommendations.

What then is the merit and added value of ex-post evaluations? Unlike the ones who write completion reports, the evaluation team is not engaged in the project and is able to give an impartial judgment. This ability should be **used in particular**, though not exclusively, to **assess the origin of the project, the project formulation process, the relevance of the project objectives, cooperation and participation, and the impact of the project**. Being ex-post, the evaluation has the opportunity to assess the situation in the project area after project completion, which adds to the insight of the real impact of the project. The team has executed its mission in accordance with these observations.

RECOMMENDATION Added value of ex-post evaluations

- 14) ITTO: The secretariat may consider to organize financial assessments, including justification of budget items, which are more in depth than regular audit reports. This could be realized separately or by adding an expert to a broader evaluation team.
- 15) ITTO: Ex-post evaluation should focus on carefully selected issues, taking into account the already available information from project completion reports and “mid-term” reviews. Issues of particular interest are: the origin of the project, the project formulation process, the relevance of the project objectives, cooperation and participation, and the impact of the project.

How to make lessons learned?

Completion reports, evaluation reports contain “lessons learned”. Many of those are familiar and seem to be reiterated over and over again. Apparently lessons are not learned, at least not sufficiently. ITTO document CEM, CFI(XXXIII)/5 “lessons learned from ex-post evaluation missions” contain common problems of projects pertaining to forest management which almost without exception apply to the four projects, which the team evaluated in South East Asia. The time seems right to step up the learning and transfer process rather than listing experiences and mistakes again. Turning lessons into action requires an **action plan to compile, analyze, translate lessons into implications**

for project design, implementation and monitoring and transfer to those who develop, implement and monitor projects.

RECOMMENDATION Lessons learned

- 16) ITTO: The ITTO secretariat may launch an activity to compile, analyze, translate lessons and experiences from projects into implications for project design, implementation and monitoring and make this information available to those who develop, implement and monitor projects.

Timing interim reviews, ex-post evaluation and approval follow-up projects.

The ex-post evaluation team came across a couple of so called “mid term” reviews (MFMA and Bulungan), which had been executed shortly before the completion of the project. It is obvious that, at that late stage, the **project itself can hardly benefit from the findings** and recommendations from these mid-term reviews but a follow-up project could take advantage of the findings. This in turn makes it even more necessary that a following ex-post evaluation would not look at the full array of issues but at **carefully selected issues to avoid duplication of work.**

In both cases, MFMA and Bulungan, the mid-term review had indeed provided a basis for a follow-up project. Project proposals had been submitted and approved by ITTO prior to the ex-post evaluation. The proposal may not comply with the findings and recommendations of the ex-post evaluation. If the proposal is not going to be **revised to incorporate appropriate conclusions and recommendations** then the whole evaluation exercise may become trivial. If there is any opportunity to learn from lessons then it would be with the development and implementation of a follow-up project.

RECOMMENDATIONS Timing of mid-term and ex-post evaluations

- 17) ITTO: Mid-term evaluations should be carried out in a timely manner so that project management may be able to correct actions according to the findings and recommendation from these evaluations.
- 18) ITTO: In cases where an ex-post evaluation is anticipated, ITTO should not accept a follow-up project proposal prior to the execution of the evaluation and should promote the incorporation of appropriate conclusions and recommendations.

Reporting and evaluation formats.

The evaluation team initially followed the format for reporting as contained in the ITTO Manual for Project Monitoring and Evaluation, second edition, 1999, as had been done by other evaluators. It appeared however that this would, and indeed had led in former reports to annoying repetitions. The team noted that completion reports suffered from the same inconvenience. Finally and after consultation with the ITTO secretariat, the team decided to follow a more straight forward format. This very report is the result of that approach.

RECOMMENDATION Reporting and evaluation formats

- 19) ITTO: Revise the reporting formats to avoid repetition and enhance accessibility.

6. SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

CONCLUSIONS

Project design

- 1) Matters which determine the **strategic value** of a project are **not always explicitly addressed** or given serious attention. This has proven to hamper efficient implementation and to weaken the ability of projects to effectively contribute to their respective development objective.
- 2) **Relevant and feasible development objectives and precise formulation of specific objectives** and consequently using the same terminology are important prerequisites for an unambiguous well understood project.
- 3) Use of a **logical framework** facilitates project design and contributes to coherence and transparency but is **no guarantee for the consistency** between activities, the anticipated outputs and objectives.
- 4) A feeling of ownership right at the formulation of the project facilitates and strengthens commitment and co-operation during the implementation. Supply driven projects (and or **science oriented projects**) tend to **overlook the importance of seriously involving stakeholders** with the formulation of the project.
- 5) The project **development process** is often not transparent and not **documented**.
- 6) **Project implementation and effectiveness benefits from a combination of implementing agencies and organisations**, which cover responsibility for national/regional policy formulation and implementation, research and science, and on the ground implementation.
- 7) Careful **site selection** is crucial for efficient and effective project implementation.
- 8) **Integration and spatially linking** of conservation and income generating measures and activities are key to successful conservation projects.
- 9) Projects with a duration longer than 3 to 4 years benefit from a **phased approach** (division in two or more phases, which are separately submitted for approval and funding). Phased approach provides insight in the follow-up of each phase. It also allows for necessary adjustments in the proposal and budget for the follow-up phase.

Participation, stakeholder involvement

- 10) Involvement and evident input in the development phase of the project creates a sense of **shared ownership**, which provide a firm basis for proactive cooperation during and beyond the implementation phase.

Efficiency

- 11) The projects have produced a great deal of the envisaged outputs but only after **extension of the implementation period and with additional funds**.

- 12) **Efficiency** of project execution is to a great extent **conditioned by project design** including accurate estimation of budgets.
- 13) **Full commitment and support at all levels of the executing agency** and strong linkages between the executing agencies and the involved actors in the district and in the field proved to be an important condition for assuring smooth and efficient project implementation.
- 14) Local office and **permanent presence** at the project site are a prerequisite for efficient implementation.
- 15) Opportunities for cooperation **with other ITTO projects** and (international) programmes have hardly been used.
- 16) **Steering committees**, provided they are lean and determined to execute their task, are indispensable project governance tools.
- 17) Adequate (scientific) knowledge of **consultants** is no guarantee for ample practical “hands-on” experiences and ability to advise in practical concrete situations.

Effectiveness, achievements and impact

- 18) The projects have produced a great deal of their **anticipated outputs and specific objectives**.
- 19) The effectiveness and potential impact of a project is to a great extent determined in the **design phase** of the project.
- 20) **Awareness** of urgency and feasibility to change forest policy and management has become stronger as a result of the ITTO projects
- 21) **Executing agencies** and **local communities** have **clearly benefited** from the projects. For other stakeholders such as timber associations and concession holders benefits were less univocal.
- 22) **Training components** are indispensable for transfer of knowledge and skills and for securing sustainability after project completion
- 23) Projects have achieved unanticipated **positive side effects**.
- 24) Projects have insufficiently elaborated extension and **dissemination mechanisms**.

Sustainability of interventions

- 25) Recipient countries and Executing Agencies consider follow-up actions of completed projects too easily a matter of external funding.
- 26) Sustainability of interventions is jeopardized by this attitude and by lack of law enforcement and autonomous developments, such as encroachment and fires.

Effectiveness as demonstration area

- 27) The aim of a demonstration area for timber production is to further step up the quality of forest management and to demonstrate the feasibility of high level forest management in practice, this requires an operational information and communication plan.
- 28) None of the project areas has reached the stage of a demonstration area. Those which have the potential based on present performance have no information and communication programme in place.
- 29) The Zedtee concession area within the present MFMA in Sarawak, has the potential to be developed successfully as a demonstration area.
The Malinau watershed, East Kalimantan could serve as a representative example of a forest development area, but not necessarily to demonstrate SFM.
The linkage and interactions between the management of the Jianfengling National Park , Hainan Island China,(conservation, education, tourism) and the adjacent areas (changed sources of income) could well be demonstrated.
Forest Health Monitoring is feasible and the two demonstration plots, West Java Indonesia are well chosen and established.

Contribution to the ITTO objective 2000

- 30) Almost any activity pertaining directly or indirectly to sustainable management could be conceived as a contribution to ITTO objective 2000. It therefore loses its significance as a distinguishing factor for relevance of projects, unless criteria are developed, which indicate direct contributions to the achievement of objective 2000.
- 31) Most projects undertook activities and produced results which indirectly may be perceived to contribute to achieving ITTO objective 2000. Only one project contributed directly by implementing more sustainable harvesting methods at a practical scale.

RECOMMENDATIONS

In the text of chapter 4 recommendations are numbered. 1 to 19. Recommendations are addressed to ITTO and Executing Agencies, including Governments. Some they are addressed to both. In this compilation the recommendations are grouped according to their relevance for ITTO or for the Executing Agencies. The numbers in brackets behind each recommendation refer to the numbers in the text chapter 4. Recommendations addressed to both ITTO and Executing Agencies are appearing twice.

To ITTO

Project design

- 1) The project development process should be documented in particular with respect to involvement of stakeholders and the degree to which ownership is perceived. (5)

Efficiency

- 2) Promote more intensive communication and cooperation with other similar ITTO projects and relevant (international) programmes in the area. (7)
- 3) Steering committees must not be seen as an information forum. Other instruments should be used to keep stakeholders informed and involved. (9)

Effectiveness, achievements and impact

- 4) A dissemination and extension strategy should be an integral part of each project proposal. The strategy should elaborate on ways and means of dissemination and transfer of information and skills to defined target groups. (10)

Sustainability of interventions

- 5) To include in project proposals a post project implementation and extension phase which will be financed by the government and co-financed by ITTO. (11)

Effectiveness as demonstration area

- 6) ITTO should explore the willingness with the government of Sarawak/Malaysia and the concessionaire to develop the Zedtee concession as a demonstration area. (12)

Contribution to the ITTO objective 2000

- 7) ITTO may wish to further develop criteria to determine what projects are perceived to contribute directly to achieving ITTO Objective 2000 (13)

Added value of ex-post evaluations

- 8) The secretariat may consider to organize financial assessments, including justification of budget items, which are more in depth than regular audit reports. This could be realized separately or by adding an expert to a broader evaluation team. (14)
- 9) Ex-post evaluation should focus on carefully selected issues, taking into account the already available information from project completion reports and “mid-term” reviews. Issues of particular interest are: the origin of the project, the project formulation process, the relevance of the project objectives, cooperation and participation, and the impact of the project. (15)

Lessons to be learned

- 10) The ITTO secretariat may launch an activity to compile, analyze, translate lessons and experiences from projects into implications for project design, implementation and monitoring and make this information available to those who develop, implement and monitor projects. (16)

Timing of mid-term and ex-post evaluations

- 11) ITTO: Mid-term evaluations should be carried out timely so that project management may be able to correct actions according to the findings and recommendation from these evaluation. (17)
- 12) ITTO: In cases where an ex-post evaluation is anticipated, ITTO should not accept a follow-up project proposal prior to the execution of the evaluation and should promote the incorporation of appropriate conclusions and recommendations. (18)

Reporting and evaluation formats

- 13) ITTO: Revise the reporting formats to avoid repetition and enhance accessibility. (19)

To Governments and Executing Agencies

Project design

- 1) Avoid areas for project implementation with exceptional complex natural, logistic and administrative conditions, do not add unnecessary complicity regarding number of actors and responsible local governments through delineation of the project area. (1)
- 2) Apply a logical framework to insure consistency of the project design and accord of anticipated objectives with outputs (2)
- 3) Full commitment and proactive participation from those actors who should play indispensable roles during later stages of the project or even after project completion must be vested during the formulation phase and maintained during the implementation phase. (3)

- 4) Costs estimates of facilities and activities and the time required to achieve planned outputs should be as realistic as possible. (4)
- 5) The project development process should be documented in particular with respect to involvement of stakeholders and the degree to which ownership is perceived. (5)
- 6) Project design and implementation should secure integration and spatial linkage of measures and activities of one project. (6)

Efficiency

- 7) Promote more intensive communication and cooperation with other similar ITTO projects and relevant (international) programmes in the area. (7)
- 8) Secure permanent presence of project management at the project site. (8)
- 9) Steering committees must not be seen as an information forum. Other instruments should be used to keep stakeholders informed and involved. (9)

Effectiveness, achievements and impact

- 10) ITTO and Executing Agencies: A dissemination and extension strategy should be an integral part of each project proposal. The strategy should elaborate on ways and means of dissemination and transfer of information and skills to defined target groups. (10)

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS *(preliminary)*

ASEAN	Association of South East Asian Nations
BRF	Bulungan Research Forest
CIFOR	Center for International Forestry Research
C&I	Criteria and Indicators
CNV	conventional logging
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FHM	Forest Health Monitoring
FMP	forest management plan
FMU	forest management unit
FORDA	Agency for Forest Research and Development
GEF	Global Environment Facility
GOI	Government of Indonesia
ha	hectare
ITTA	International Tropical Timber Agreement
ITTC	International Tropical Timber Council
ITTO	International Tropical Timber Organization
JICA	Japanese International Co-operation Agency
LEI	Lembaga Ekolabel Indonesia
MFMA	Model Forest Management Area
MOF	Ministry of Forestry
NFI	National Forestry Inventory
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NTFP	non-timber forest product
PD	project document
PSC	Project Steering Committee
RIL	reduced impact logging
SA	slash-and-burn agriculture
SAMEO-BIOTROP	South East Asian Regional Centre for Tropical Biology
SC	Steering Committee
SFM	sustainable forest management
VJR	Virgin Jungle Reserves
USD	United States Dollar

USDA

United States Development Agency

WWF

Worldwide Fund for Nature

Annex I

Terms of Reference

Ex-Post Evaluation of ITTO Projects in the Field of

Demonstration Areas/Model Forests for Sustainable Forest Management

Implemented in Asia

I. Background

ITTO is an intergovernmental commodity organization established in 1986 to administer the provisions and operation of the International Tropical Timber Agreement (ITTA), particularly in the promotion of international trade in tropical timber, the sustainable management of tropical forests and the development of tropical forest industries through international cooperation, policy work and project activities.

The five projects that will be the subject of the Ex-post Evaluation are as follows:

1. PD 105/90 Rev.1 (F) Model Forest Management Area – Phase I (Malaysia)
2. PD 14/95 Rev.2 (F) Model Forest Management Area – Phase II (Malaysia)
2. PD 14/92 Rev.2 (F) A Demonstration Program of Sustainable Utilization of Tropical Forests by Means of Differentiated Management in Hainan Island, China – Phases I, II, III (China)
4. PD 16/95 Rev.2 (F) Forest Health Monitoring to Monitor the Sustainability of Indonesian Tropical Rain Forests (Indonesia)
5. PD 12/97 Rev.1 (F) Forest, Science and Sustainability: The Bulungan Model Forest (Indonesia)

The background information of the projects is provided in Annex to the Terms of Reference.

II. Purpose and Scope of Evaluation

A) Purpose

The primary purpose of the evaluation is to provide a concise diagnosis of five projects related to Demonstration Areas/Model Forests for Sustainable Forest Management so as to point out the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures, and the contribution of the projects towards the achievement of ITTO's Objective 2000, and to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future.

B) Scope of Work

- a) Analyze and assess for each project:

1. The overall role and contribution of the project in light of sectoral policies, development programmes, priorities and requirements to achieve sustainable forest management in the country concerned.
2. The current management status of the forests within the project's area of influence, the effectiveness of the project's implementation and its effectiveness in promoting sustainable forest management as defined in the ITTO Criteria and Indicators for Sustainable Forest Management.
3. The effectiveness of the project area as a demonstration area or model forest for sustainable forest management.
4. The contributions of the specific studies in various disciplines (inventory, ecology, socio-economy, forest engineering, forest industry, silviculture, etc.) prepared by the project to the development of forestry in the project's area of influence.
5. The results and potential impact of the applied research conducted by the project on the application of forest management practices and its contribution to the overall forestry-related knowledge in the region.
6. The impact of project activities on the livelihoods of target populations.
7. The effectiveness of dissemination of project results.
8. The overall post-project situation in the project's area of influence.
9. The unexpected effects and impacts, either harmful or beneficial, and the reasons for their occurrences.
10. The cost efficiency in the implementation of the project, including the technical, financial and managerial aspects.
11. Follow-up actions in order to enhance uptake of project results.
12. The project's relative success or failure, including a summary of the key lessons learnt; and the identification of any issues or problems that should be taken into account in designing and implementing similar projects in the future.

b) Provide a synthesis to:

1. assess the overall role and meaningful contribution of the five projects in achieving sustainable forest management in tropical timber producing countries taking into account ITTO's objectives, Yokohama Action Plan and Objective 2000, in particular as regards the implementation of priority actions identified by the ITTO as essential for progress towards the Objective 2000, as follows:
 - Adopt a forest policy and apply legislation;
 - Secure the permanent forest estate;
 - Apply reduced impact logging;
 - Train the work force, including supervisors, in reduced impact logging;
 - Limit timber harvest to the sustained yield capacity;
 - Raise public awareness that timber harvesting can be consistent with the sustainability of tropical forests;
 - Focus forest research on the analysis and use of existing data and knowledge
2. assess the overall appropriateness of the designs and objectives, outputs and implementation approaches of the five projects in light of their efficiencies and effectiveness to assist promoting sustainable forest management and to contribute to achieve Objective 2000.
3. evaluate the overall impact on and relevance of the five projects for the Executing Agencies, the forest industry sector and local communities being served and the countries concerned.
4. evaluate the overall attainment of the objectives and to assess the overall effectiveness of the five projects.
5. evaluate the overall effectiveness of the five projects as models or demonstration areas for sustainable forest management.
6. evaluate the overall appropriateness of the costs and cost structure and use of resources within the five projects.

And make recommendations on:

1. the needs for similar projects in the future.

2. the objectives of such future projects.
3. innovative approaches/designs for projects aiming at promoting sustainable forest management in the tropics.
4. the effectiveness of the demonstration area/model forest approach to promoting sustainable forest management.
5. appropriate target groups, e.g. countries, government, organizations, forestry sector, local communities.
6. the organizational arrangements of the projects.
7. follow-up and evaluation practices.
8. supplemental, alternative activities, processes, procedures, and/or follow-up programmes in the field of Sustainable Forest Management, if appropriate.
9. further actions needed to sustain or increase the intended effects on sustainable forest management and Objective 2000 and to draw conclusions which may be of relevance to other ITTO projects in the field of sustainable forest management.

III. Approach

A) Composition of the evaluation team

The team will be composed of three consultants who will work together. The assignment of specific tasks within the TOR will be left to the consultants based on their individual expertise. One of the consultants will be team leader in charge of the final report and the presentation of the results at the Thirty-fifth Council Session in Yokohama in November 2003.

B) Consultation during evaluation exercise

The team will maintain close liaison with ITTO and will carry out its work in close cooperation with the concerned Executing Agencies and Governments in Indonesia, Malaysia and China. Although the team should feel free to discuss with the authorities concerned all matters relevant to its assignment, it is not authorized to make any commitments on behalf of ITTO.

C) Activities and report of the team

The work required in this evaluation will consist of:

Desk review of project-related documents and materials provided by ITTO and possibly a brief orientation visit to ITTO headquarters in Yokohama.

Missions in Malaysia, Indonesia and China. The evaluation team will visit each project's Executing Agency headquarters for a further desk review of project materials and to carry out evaluation work in connection with the Executing Agencies. The missions shall also include a field visit to each of the projects' area of influence to review field implementation and to evaluate the project results and impact, and should include discussions with project stakeholders and target beneficiaries. A minimum of five working days is required for each project.

Preparation of an Ex-post Evaluation Report for each project in English in accordance with the Scope of Work and the checklist contained in the ITTO Manual for Project Monitoring, Review and Evaluation. For projects PD 105/90 Rev.1 (F) and PD 14/95 Rev.2 (F) only one report is required.

Preparation of an Overall Executive Summary [synthesis; see b) Scope of Work] of the four ex-post evaluation reports focusing on the overall assessment of the projects' relative success in contributing to ITTO's Objective 2000, summarizing the key lessons learnt; and identifying any issues or problems which constrained their contribution to the achievement of Objective 2000.

Presentation of the Overall Executive Summary at the Thirty-fifth Session of the International Tropical Timber Council (November 2003, Yokohama).

Preparation of an article for possible publication in the ITTO Tropical Forest Update (TFU), in consultation with the editor, containing an overview of the projects and summarizing the lessons learned from the evaluation work. Appropriate high-resolution photographs should be provided.

In writing the Ex-post Evaluation reports, the team will have the opportunity to discuss its preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations with the representatives of each of the Executing Agencies, Governments and ITTO before the final version of the report is made. Responsibility for the final content of the reports, however, remains with the evaluation team.

Duration of the assignment

The duration of the assignment will be one month and a half (two months for the team leader) and will consist of approximately one month travelling in the countries concerned and remaining time for preparation of the evaluation and report writing.

Proposed Work Schedule

- 1 June – 30 July 2003 Desk and field studies including orientation visit to Yokohama
 - 30 July 2003 Submission of draft reports to ITTO and to each of the Project Executing Agencies for comments and suggestions.
 - 31 August 2003 Submission of the final ex-post evaluation reports and the overall executive summary to ITTO.
 - 4-5 November 2003 Submission and presentation of the Final Report at the Thirty-third Session of the Committee on Reforestation and Forest Management during the Thirty-fifth Council Session in Yokohama, Japan (team leader).
-